

ANTONIO CHEMOTTI, THE HYMNBOOK OF VALENTIN TRILLER  
(WROCŁAW 1555). MUSICAL PAST AND REGIONALISM  
IN EARLY MODERN SILESIA

Warsaw 2020 Instytut Sztuki Polskiej Akademii Nauk, pp. XXIV+292.  
ISBN 978-83-66519-05-3, online at <https://epub.uni-regensburg.de/43464/>

Antonio Chemotti's new study of a somewhat obscure Lutheran hymnbook printed in 1555 in Wrocław – a city that for many centuries was also referred to by its inhabitants as 'Breslau' – is one of the many fascinating publications to come out of 'Sound Memories', an international, European Union-funded research initiative which concluded its three-year investigation period in September 2019. The various publications reflect the project's commitment to investigating 'the mechanisms by which Europeans of a distant past (c. 1200–1600) used collective musical memory to shape cultural and political behaviour'.<sup>1</sup> As this description suggests, participants share an interest less in historical sound in general (as taken up most recently by Niall Atkinson, Emma Dillon and Alexander Fisher, among others) than in specifically *musical* sounds and the 'memories' – i.e. the constructions of the past – these musical sounds preserve.<sup>2</sup>

Accordingly, research teams explored how a sense of musical historicity took shape in France, the Low Countries, Germany, Bohemia, Poland and Italy in the periods often referred to as 'medieval' and 'early modern'. The diverse perspectives of

participating scholars converge on a central concern: the circulation and performance of music that was thought of as 'old' by its medieval and early modern transmitters.<sup>3</sup> This focal point brings into clear view musical sources and practices marginalized or obscured by canonical music-historical narratives, driven as they are by the search for novelty and innovation.

Viewed broadly, the project's emphasis on music's political and cultural uses is well suited to writing music histories of regions like Silesia and Bohemia that were long characterized by religious, ethnic and linguistic pluralism – the present-day absence of which reflects the devastating ruptures, displacements and genocides of the twentieth century. More narrowly, the question of how and why medieval and early modern Europeans developed and mobilized a sense of a shared musical past is apt for examining the music circulating in the early years of the Reformation, when those Christians breaking with Catholic belief and practice made decisions about what to do with the liturgy and music they inherited. What would they retain? What would they update? What would they reject as hopelessly corrupted? And which sounds from their own worlds might they preserve and repurpose for worship?

These questions motivate Chemotti's deep dive into a German-language hymnal prepared in the 1550s by a Silesian Lutheran pastor named Valentin Triller, and issued by Crispin Scharffenberg – well established

1 'Sound Memories: The Musical Past in Late-Medieval and Early-Modern Europe' (SoundMe), <https://soundme.eu/>, accessed 17 April 2021.

2 Niall Atkinson, *The Noisy Renaissance: Sound, Architecture, and Florentine Urban Life*, University Park, Pennsylvania 2016; Emma Dillon, *The Sense of Sound. Musical Meaning in France, 1260–1330*, Oxford–New York 2012; Alexander Fisher, *Music, Piety, and Propaganda. The Soundscapes of Counter-Reformation Bavaria*, Oxford–New York 2014.

3 Sound Memories: Publications, <https://soundme.eu/publications/>, accessed 1 May 2021.

in Wrocław, but just getting started in the business of music printing. More than an anthologizer, Triller selected pre-existing plainchant, hymns, two-voice *cantiones*, secular tunes and motets, and replaced the words with texts evidently of his own devising. Triller and Scharffenberg, a native of Lusatia, furnished their hymn collection with an unusual title: not some variant of the generic titles such as ‘Geistlich Gesangbuch’ (‘sacred songbook’) or ‘Geistliche Lieder’ (‘sacred songs’) favoured by the compilers of the first Wittenberg hymnals, but rather *Ein Schlesisch [sic] singebüchlein* – *A Little Silesian Songbook* or, as Chemotti translates it, *A Little Silesian Hymnbook*.<sup>4</sup> Though styled a ‘Büchlein’ (‘little book’) the print is quite substantial for the time, comprising nearly 150 hymns suitable for use throughout the year. Their texts and framing place the hymns among the repertory that Christopher Boyd Brown memorably characterizes as ‘amphibious’, equally suited for use in the home or at church.<sup>5</sup>

Triller’s hymnal – available for digital perusal via the University of Wrocław’s Digital Library – is curious on a number of counts.<sup>6</sup> Readers familiar with sixteenth- and seventeenth-century hymnals will be struck by the layout: oblong quarto (i.e. ‘landscape’) format, rather than the upright (i.e. ‘portrait’) format that was already standard. Likewise unexpected is its free juxtaposition of monophonic and polyphonic hymns. Several of the latter feature

cadences and textures more redolent of the 1450s than the 1550s, while the choice to print the parts successively, sometimes over a page turn, poses obvious logistical challenges for performance. But it is the question of what Triller and Scharffenberg had in mind when they invoked ‘Silesia’ in their *Little Silesian Songbook* that Chemotti takes as his point of departure. He revisits this issue fruitfully over the course of the book, using it to inform the other questions he asks about layout, style, purpose, Triller’s engagement with pre-existing music and, not least, his decision to call attention to its age and presumed ubiquity with the descriptors ‘old’ (‘alt’) and ‘familiar’ (‘gewöhnlich’) on the title page.

*Ein Schlesisch singebüchlein* was previously the subject of brief articles by Hellmut Eberlein (1955) and Konrad Ameln (1971), but its appeal as an object for sustained music-historical study was limited by the obscurity of its compiler and the absence of new music.<sup>7</sup> Chemotti has written the first study of the hymnbook in its entirety and on its own terms, probing it for what its musical texts and paratexts can reveal about an emergent sense of Silesian musical identity, as well as the methods and priorities of Lutheran hymnodists in the early years of the Reformation. Having issued a critical edition of the polyphonic hymns in 2019, he approaches the book with a formidable and deep understanding of its contents.<sup>8</sup> He scrutinizes the book from every conceivable

4 Johann Walter, *Eyn geystlich Gesangk Buchleyn*, Wittenberg 1524; Joseph Klug, *Geystliche Lieder*, Wittenberg 1529; Martin Luther, *Geystliche Lieder*, Wittenberg 1545.

5 Christopher Boyd Brown, ‘Devotional Life in Hymns, Liturgy, Music, and Prayer’, in: *Lutheran Ecclesiastical Culture, 1550–1675*, ed. Robert Kolb, Leiden 2008, pp. 205–258 at 205.

6 The 1555 print may be viewed at the following link: [oai:www.bibliotekacyfrowa.pl:11774](https://www.bibliotekacyfrowa.pl:11774); the 1559 *Titelaufgabe* can be accessed at [oai:www.bibliotekacyfrowa.pl:63705](https://www.bibliotekacyfrowa.pl:63705).

7 Hellmut Eberlein, ‘Valentin Triller und sein schlesisches Singebüchlein’, *Jahrbuch für schlesische Kirche und Kirchengeschichte* 34 (1955), pp. 48–58; Konrad Ameln, ‘Valentin Trillers Bekenntnis’, *Jahrbuch für Liturgik und Hymnologie* 16 (1971), pp. 163–169.

8 *The Polyphonic Hymns of Valentin Triller’s ‘Ein Schlesisch singebüchlein’ (Wrocław 1555)*, ed. Antonio Chemotti, Warsaw 2019; available open-access at <https://epub.uni-regensburg.de/38328/> (urn:nbn:de:bvb:355-epub-383281; DOI: 10.5283/epub.38328).

perspective: texts and paratexts, music notation, organization, reception and the materiality of extant copies. His observations and arguments unfold over the course of five chapters, supplemented with substantial appendices and a wide-ranging bibliography. Meticulous and thorough, the study proceeds clearly and logically from contexts (Chapter 1) to paratexts (Chapters 2 and 3) to musical texts (Chapter 4) and finally to the reception of the book in the years following its printing, and its afterlives in the music collections of subsequent generations (Chapter 5).

The chapters are prefaced by a brief introduction that delineates the study's throughlines while also sensitively introducing readers to the challenges and possibilities of writing the music history of a region whose past remains contested. Chemotti makes a compelling case for using Triller's hymnal to recover the status of sixteenth-century Silesia as a 'real entity' in the consciousness not only of its inhabitants but also of Silesia's neighbouring territories (p. 6): Bohemia, Moravia and Saxony. Rejecting anachronistic projections of national identities onto the book's creators and users, he forwards what might be termed a 'regional imaginary' as a framework for interpretation. In doing so, he takes an important step towards suturing a European music history fragmented by nationalist narratives and the disciplinary divisions – wrought by the Iron Curtain – between musicologists working in, and on, 'Eastern' and 'Western' Europe.

Scharffenberg and Triller take centre stage in Chapter 1 ('Printer and Editor', pp. 9–23). Chemotti characterizes the pair as partners of sorts, wisely pre-empting assumptions that layout and content necessarily reflect editorial choices rather than the sorts of practical exigencies to which a printer would have been attuned. He surveys Scharffenberg's other projects in the 1550s, ingeniously accounting for the hymnal's unusual layout by noting that the printer issued two other,

unrelated music prints that year, perhaps even at the same time (p. 15): collections of instrumental dances for which, as with other polyphonic prints, the oblong disposition was common. He also shows that Scharffenberg's total output suggests a long-term interest in meeting the considerable needs of the local school market; it is not incidental, for instance, that Scharffenberg issued Philipp Melancthon's *Grammatices Latinae elementa* a few years after Triller's hymnbook, and that he subsequently printed Nikolaus Listenius's *Musica* and other standard music fundamentals texts.

Both Chemotti's attention to Scharffenberg and his aside in the chapter's opening paragraph (p. 9) about the anonymous men and women who made paper, composed type and inked pages reflect a welcome sensitivity to the many forms of labour that went into book production. Whatever Triller might have envisioned, the songbook took its material shape in the hands of the hunched figures populating the printing workshops in Jost Amman's treatise on the professions and trades, *Panoplia omnium illiberalium mechanicarum aut sedentariarum artium genera continens...* (Frankfurt 1568), and Jan Collaert's *Nova reperta* (Antwerp c. 1600) – the 'sweating brethren' ('sudantum fratrum') to whose labours and vices the Czech humanist Jiří Carolides, closer to Triller's home, paid humorous tribute in his poem 'On and for printers'.<sup>9</sup>

<sup>9</sup> See Jost Amman, *Panoplia omnium illiberalium mechanicarum aut sedentariarum artium genera continens*, Frankfurt 1568, f. C3r; viewable at [MUZYKA 2021/3](https://luna.folger.edu/luna/servlet/detail/FOLGERCM1-6-6-637795-142616:Panoplia-omnium-illiberalium-mechan; Johannes Stradanus, Plate 19 in: Jan Collaert, <i>Nova reperta</i>, Antwerp c. 1600; Jiří Carolides, 'De et pro Typographis' in: Elizabeth Weston, <i>Parthenicon</i>, Prague 1606, ff. D3v–D4r; for an edition and translation, see <i>Elizabeth Jane Weston: Collected Writings</i>, ed. and trans. Donald Cheney and Brenda M. Hosington, Toronto 2000, pp. 86–89.</p>
</div>
<div data-bbox=)

The discussion of Triller in the second half of Chapter 1 corrects errors in his biography, most notably the assertion (ubiquitous in the secondary literature) that Triller was a radical reformer in the spirit of his fellow Silesian Caspar Schwenckfeld. These correctives lay the groundwork for Chapter 2, 'The Hymnbook through its Paratexts' (pp. 24–63), which focuses on Triller's lengthy dedication to Duke Georg II of Brieg, the 'Preface to the Christian Reader' and the other paratexts with which Triller framed his book for readers. The helpful overview of the diverse connotations of the term 'Silesia' in the sixteenth century that opens the chapter helps the present-day reader understand it in terms as multifaceted and polyvalent as did Triller and his readers – invoking aspects of region, dynasty, language and ethnicity.

Chemotti's discussion of the dedication reflects the absorption of the methods and vocabulary of book history into musicology in the 20 years since the appearance of the essay collection *Music and the Cultures of Print* (ed. Kate Van Orden).<sup>10</sup> Close readings of dedications are by now methodological mainstays in studies of early modern music prints, but it takes considerable familiarity with the habits of hymnodists to be able to distinguish so judiciously between formulaic phrases and rhetorical moves unique to this print. Chemotti's expertise enables him to explain why the dedication turns in its final section to the wording of the Augsburg Confession. He argues convincingly that, in light of the specific confessional politics of Triller's Silesia, the accusations levelled at Triller by other Protestant polemicists and Triller's own statements in private letters, the dedication's incorporation of elements from the most fundamental of Lutheran doctrinal statements is in itself a confession of faith – affirming Triller's orthodoxy and rejecting the radical beliefs of the Schwenckfelders and other 'sectarians' (p. 41).

Turning his attention to the 'Preface to the Christian Reader', Chemotti observes that, despite Triller's implication that the music he has collected is not difficult, some hymns would have exceeded the skills of a lay singer, and that as a whole the collection requires diverse performance forces, not necessarily available at small churches: some items could be sung individually or congregationally, while others clearly require choirs. He concludes that Triller probably intended this music for public worship (including sung worship *by* the public) in urban and rural churches alike, but that the primary reader would have been the pastor, cantor or organist who led the sung portions of worship (pp. 61–63).

Chemotti zeroes in on Triller's rationale for preparing the collection, which forms an important piece of his larger argument about Triller's understanding of the musical past. Chemotti finds not just the usual complaints that error-filled copies were floating around (although those are there too), but also claims that Triller wished to preserve, as a gift to his fellow Silesians, 'the best old, familiar, and fine melodies that were formerly familiar in the localities and churches of our Silesia'. It becomes clear, when taking into account which items Triller identified as 'old', that he has in mind not the musical practices of an ancient, ideal Biblical past, or an abstract past before the 'papist' corruption of Christian belief, as was usually the case for contemporary hymnodists (pp. 44–56). Rather, Triller's 'old and familiar' melodies belonged to 'a past that [he] himself could remember personally'. He considered these melodies to be 'our' music, the music of 'our Silesia', even as he lamented that they were fading in the memories of his compatriots, displaced by 'new and unfamiliar' foreign imports.

The third chapter, 'Content Arrangement and Liturgical Assignments' (pp. 64–98), shows just how much can be learned from the order in which hymns are presented, and

<sup>10</sup> New York–London 2000.

also from prefatory rubrics that are all too easy to dismiss as incidental or redundant. Triller's rubrics are remarkably consistent and detailed, suggesting not only performance occasion, but also indicating the source material for his contrafacta. Chemotti is thus able to extrapolate the arrangement of the book's contents vis-a-vis the church year and also to speculate about how Triller understood genre. He moves well beyond what is indicated by the headings, comparing source material and re-texting to show that Triller was remarkably faithful to the original forms of the music he selected and also that the genre of the source material informed the ordering of his contrafacta.

It is clear from Chemotti's analysis that Triller had a preservationist impulse, coupled with the theological purity of a pastor for whom the words of worship were of paramount importance. Still, the relationship of his re-textings to their musical forebears is complicated. As Chemotti notes, by the 1550s, vernacular hymnody was sufficiently well established that his contrafacta interacted with a recent musical past that was already stratified. Triller's *Der Herr und ware Gott* (no. 4), for example, engages a pre-Reformation Latin model (the Advent sequence *Mittit ad virginem*), as well as the cluster of vernacular Advent hymns that were derived from it and circulating both orally and in print (pp. 96–97). To support his points, Chemotti not only provides Cantus ID numbers (drawn from the *Cantus Index: Catalogue of Chant Texts and Melodies*) where applicable, but also refers to a broad range of manuscripts and databases less familiar to most chant and hymn scholars (e.g. the *Index Sequentiarum Bohemiae Medii Aevii* and *Cantus Planus in Polonia*).<sup>11</sup>

11 For the *Cantus Index*, refer to <http://cantusindex.org/>; for the *Index Sequentiarum Bohemiae Medii Aevii*, see <http://hymnologica.cz/>; for *Cantus Planus in Polonia*, see <http://cantus.is-pan.pl/>; accessed 30 May 2021.

Chemotti connects the hymnbook's organizational coherence to Triller's aspiration not only to 'shape the musical apparatus of Lutheran liturgies and devotions' (p. 64) but also to 'reform the soundscape' of Lutheran worship in Silesia (p. 98). While there is no question that Triller was systematic in fascinating and revealing ways, the conflation of 'musical practice' with 'soundscape' (slippage evident in the larger 'Sound Memories' project, as well) did give me brief pause, as it seems to promise more insight into sound, understood capaciously, than this particular hymnal can deliver.

In Chapter 4 ('Repertory', pp. 99–155), Chemotti adopts an insider's perspective on the hymnal's contents by undertaking what he astutely calls 'historically informed genre analysis' (p. 102). He prioritizes the historical understanding of characteristic forms, functions and textual and musical features and takes seriously Triller's own genre specifications – for example, whether a model was a *Benedicamus*, *Introitus*, *Invitatorium*, etc. He also attends to the appearance of the notation (both 'German Gothic' and white mensural), rather than merely focusing on pitch content, drawing attention to the different styles and idioms of the contents, while also hinting at the chronological layers (pp. 99–102). He points out that a handful of hymn tunes (e.g. *Resonet in laudibus* and *Christ ist erstanden*) were deemed so well known by Triller that he did not provide notation (p. 101). Chemotti notes that the omission of notation (even where, as with *Psallat clerus de Vergine*, the hymn is entirely unknown in contemporary sources) reflects a melody's popularity – in every sense of the word – in Silesia.

Here, as in the book as a whole, the thoroughness of the detailed engagement brings into view larger conclusions that would not be apparent to scholars less immersed in this material. Chemotti distinguishes between those of Triller's monophonic hymns whose melodies came from *Tenorlieder* not

previously contrafacted, and those which *had* been contrafacted by others, revealing where Triller's recension suggests a distinct tradition from, for example, the Wittenberg prints of Joseph Klug, issued the previous decade. One of Chemotti's most fascinating observations is that Triller does not use the descriptor 'old' for plainchant, for all that it was obviously and incontrovertibly ancient; instead, he uses it for the vernacular hymns and *Tenorlieder* which had been circulating for a couple of generations. Chemotti is careful not to ascribe to Triller ignorance of the antiquity of plainchant; rather he correctly notes that plainchant was not generally regarded historically (pp. 109–110). In a particularly lovely turn of phrase, he writes simply: '[e]vidently, time passed differently for different genres' (p. 110) – reminding us that for Triller, and for the devout and musical men and women of his time and place – the sense of 'old' and 'new' and, indeed 'timeless', were matters of perception.

The main emphasis of the chapter, however, is on the age and transmission patterns of the polyphonic repertory. Here, Chemotti's extensive previous engagement with the polyphonic hymns pays off. It is impossible to encapsulate his many observations here, but suffice it to say that they are a goldmine for scholars interested in the circulation of sacred repertory in Silesia, but also in Bohemia and Moravia in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries. Noting concordances with Bohemian manuscripts used by Hussite literary brotherhoods, he is able to show how long some of Triller's polyphonic models had been circulating. The larger point he makes is that whether or not such models were *originally* 'Utraquist' or 'Bohemian' is incidental; more interesting historiographically is what these concordances reveal about a shared regional musical culture (p. 126). As he remarks in a wonderful line a bit later in the chapter, this music 'was "at home" in different contexts, including outside of Bohemia' (p. 141).

Chapter 5 ('Reception', pp. 156–178) takes up the question of whether the book did what Triller hoped it might. The brief answer is: probably not, at least not right away. It seems that Triller's idea of Silesian song did not capture the interest of his fellow Silesians. While it would be risky to make such claims on the basis of the number of extant copies, Chemotti rests his assertions on solid ground: a set of observations made in Chapter 1 (pp. 15–16) about the relationship between the 1555 print and the *Christlich Singebuch* released in 1559 by Triller and Scharffenberg. In that chapter, he showed that the later hymnal is neither a new print, nor a reprint, of the *Schlesisch Singebüchlein*. It is, instead, a *Titelaufilage*, an attempt by printer and editor to repack-age what remained unsold from the original printing run. Saddled with extra copies of their little Silesian hymnal, Scharffenberg and Triller renamed the collection. The new title page jettisons the reference to Silesia, reaching out to Christians 'young and old, the common people and the learned'. This is as compelling a case as one could hope for that Triller and Scharffenberg misjudged their market in 1555.

Chemotti's study is clearly written and organized, with thoughtful concessions to those many readers for whom the orthographic and typographic particularities of sixteenth-century German might be unfamiliar. The inclusion of diplomatic transcriptions of the paratexts in Appendix A (pp. 187–194) might seem indulgent or redundant given the digitization of the print, were it not for the expansion of the abbreviations in the transcription, and for Grantley McDonald's excellent translations, which render the sometimes convoluted language comprehensible to non-specialists. Appendix B ('Catalogue of the Hymns in Triller's Hymnbook', pp. 195–231), which provides not only information from the rubrics but also information about notation and tonal type, as well as references in

*Das deutsche Kirchenlied*, will be indispensable for scholars seeking out a particular melody or engaging in a comparative study with other hymnals. Appendix C (pp. 232–259), which provides concordances for Triller's polyphonic hymns, along with Chemotti's observations about notation and rubrics, is likewise invaluable.

The idiomatic and clear English makes the occasional infelicity (e.g. 'duchies and state-countries', p. 5) stand out. The term 'spiritualist' for 'Schwenkfeldian' (p. 22 and *passim*) will for some readers suggest occultism, as 'spiritualism' is more typically used to describe the nineteenth-century interest in speaking to spirits. A more idiomatic term would be 'radical reformer', which has the added benefit of connecting Schwenkfeldians to Anabaptists, anti-Trinitarians, Calvinists, Zwinglians and other groups whose reforms were considered too radical by many Lutherans. Similarly, 'vom Jüngsten Tage' is best translated as 'Judgement Day' rather than 'of the latter day' (p. 14, n. 28). Some readers might stumble on the word 'monodic' (e.g. p. 100) which Chemotti uses instead of 'monophonic', as 'monody' as used in English-language scholarship designates the accompanied solo song developed by the Florentine Camerata. These are, however, minor errors, and only on occasion does an unusual word choice – as when 'conscience' is used when 'consciousness' was intended – obscure the meaning.

Perhaps because Chemotti's scrupulous engagement with Triller's book sensitized me to paratexts and layout, I found myself more attentive to these aspects than usual. I found much to admire about the book's production, not least the decision to make an open-access copy available.<sup>12</sup> I was surprised and delighted to see on the copyright page that the scholars who reviewed

the manuscript before publication were identified, modelling a kind of transparency around peer review that is not typical of Anglo-American scholarly monographs. That the two reviewers were Tomasz Jeż and Christian Leitmeir, both specialists in sacred music in post-Reformation Central Europe, signals the commitment of the editorial board and publisher to the highest scholarly standards; in light of Chemotti's points about the legacy of the Iron Curtain and the multi-ethnic character of Silesia, it is also poignant to have the work of an Italian scholar be assessed by scholars active on both sides of the former East-West divide.

The hard copy, available for purchase, is printed on good-quality paper, and bound so well that the pages lie flat without effort. I did find the sans serif font, densely typeset and so light-weight that it appeared grey, was hard to read, and in such a meticulous book, the inconsistent pagination of the prefatory materials was a bit jarring. Consulting the electronic copy, I found myself wishing that the possibilities of the digital format had been more fully explored. A useful point of comparison is the recent essay collection *Acoustemologies in Contact: Sounding Objects and Modes of Listening in Early Modernity* (ed. Emily Wilbourne and Suzanne Cusick). Issued by Open Book Publishers, the collection is available in both HTML and PDF forms, and thus is easily read on tablets, phones and computers.<sup>13</sup>

A few things would have made this invaluable study easier to navigate. Since links to the digitized copies of the 1555 and 1559 hymnals are not yet posted to RISM, it would have been helpful to provide them in the prefatory material or in conjunction

<sup>12</sup> Hosted by the University of Regensburg (urn:nbn:de:bvb:355-epub-383281; DOI: 10.5283/epub.38328).

<sup>13</sup> *Acoustemologies in Contact. Sounding Subjects and Modes of Listening in Early Modernity*, eds. Emily Wilbourne and Suzanne Cusick, Cambridge 2021, <https://doi.org/10.11647/OBP.0226>, accessed 30 May 2021.

with the link to the e-book. A historical map would have been helpful for orientation, given how radically the borders (particularly of the surrounding territories) have shifted over the centuries. Some information (e.g. Table 8, which shows sources for *Veni sancte spiritus / Da gaudiorum*) could have been more helpful if presented as a stemma diagram (however speculative). From the reader's perspective, some of the bibliographic practices are cumbersome. For example, Philipp Wackernagel's *Bibliographie zur Geschichte des deutschen Kirchenliedes im XVI. Jahrhundert* is in the 'Abbreviations' (as 'WB') but not in the 'Bibliography' at the end of the book, whereas Siegismund Ehrhardt's *Presbyterologie des evangelischen Schlesiens* (Liegnitz 1782), mentioned in the same paragraph, is included in the 'Bibliography' but not in the 'Primary Sources and Sigla'. I mention Ehrhardt not to be nit-picky but to suggest that bibliographies can also be sites of analysis, and that it would be consistent with Chemotti's larger points to position Ehrhardt as a primary source on the historiography of Silesian hymnody.

The study at hand is a most welcome contribution to scholarly understandings of sacred music in Central Europe in the decades just following the Lutheran Reformation. It wonderfully confounds teleological narratives of sixteenth-century musical developments – even within the Lutheran tradition: how else to account for the poly-textual hymn *Komb güttiger und tewrer Gott / Ein reicher milter Geist* discussed extensively in Chapter 4 (pp. 127–134)? Chemotti's book is at once both a rewarding study of a music-historical moment in a region that has received little attention in English-language scholarship and also an invitation to reflect on the ways music books can preserve the past – past ideas and ideal pasts – as imagined by ordinary people. It is clear from Chemotti's study that Triller's hymns are not only scripts for worship, but also – and just as importantly – inscriptions of

aural memories that he and Scharffenberg assumed their fellow Silesians shared. In short, Chemotti gives us access to Triller's memories of his homeland's musical past.

This point calls to mind the large question motivating the 'Sound Memories' study group: 'In which ways are these mechanisms relevant to the societies of twenty-first-century Europe?' Chemotti does not write a memory-oriented history of the sort that historian Allan Megill has warned against: the sort that prioritizes present-day popular understandings or 'memories' of events and forecloses histories (and cannot account for sources) that suggest other sorts of narratives.<sup>14</sup> His study instead exemplifies some of the complexities of using music notation as a historical document – complexities addressed beautifully by Michael Beckerman, also for musical sources in Central Europe, but at a much darker time in its history.<sup>15</sup> For the twenty-first-century musicologist, Triller's hymnal offers a way into a time when the music with which Silesian Christians worshipped bore the imprints of the neighbours (co-religionists and otherwise) who remembered – and sang – the same tunes. In Chemotti's expert hands, the 'little Silesian songbook' becomes a kind of resonant chamber, filled with nested musical memories: a collection of recollections that were in danger of being forgotten or displaced.

Erika Supria Honisch  
Stony Brook University

14 Allan Megill, *Historical Knowledge, Historical Error. A Contemporary Guide to Practice*, Chicago 2007.

15 Michael Beckerman, 'What Kind of Historical Document is a Musical Score? A Meditation in Ten Parts on Klein's Trio', in: *The Orel Foundation: Rediscovering Suppressed Musical Treasures of the Twentieth Century*, available at [http://orelfoundation.org/journal/journalArticle/what\\_kind\\_of\\_historical\\_document\\_is\\_a\\_musical\\_score](http://orelfoundation.org/journal/journalArticle/what_kind_of_historical_document_is_a_musical_score), accessed 21 March 2021.