

RYAN O'SULLIVAN
LEUVEN
ORCID 0009-0009-5843-0621

VERNACULAR CONTRAFAC TA IN THE LEUVEN CHANSONNIER?
CARON'S *HELAS* AND THE ANONYMOUS *AIME QUI VOULDR A*

ABSTRACT Chanson scholarship often distrusts fifteenth-century Italian or Central European sources that transmit contrafacta, whereas manuscripts from France or the Low Countries enjoy higher status because their texts are presumed authentic. I counter this imbalance by applying the critical scrutiny usually reserved for peripheral sources to a central source, the Leuven Chansonnier. Despite all its chanson texts initially appearing to be authentic, I argue that two are probably contrafacta: Firminus Caron's *Helas que pourra devenir* and the anonymous *Aime qui voudra*.

KEYWORDS chanson, rondeau, fifteenth century, polyphony, Leuven Chansonnier, contrafacta, centre, periphery, Firminus Caron, *Helas*

ABSTRAKT Wernakularne kontrafaktury w Leuven Chansonnier? „*Helas*” Carona i anonimowe „*Aime qui voudra*”. Badania nad chanson często odnoszą się z rezerwą do przekazów kontrafaktur w piętnastowiecznych źródłach włoskich i środkowoeuropejskich, podczas gdy rękopisy z Francji i Niderlandów cieszą się większym prestiżem – ich teksty uznaje się bowiem za autentyczne. Staram się zakwestionować tę nierównowagę, stosując analizę krytyczną – zwykle zarezerwowaną dla źródeł peryferyjnych – do Leuven Chansonnier, źródła uchodzącego za centralne. Choć wszystkie zawarte w nim teksty chansons na pierwszy rzut oka sprawiają wrażenie autentycznych, dowodzę, że dwa z nich – *Helas que pourra devenir* Firminusa Carona oraz anonimowe *Aime qui voudra* – to najprawdopodobniej kontrafaktury.

SŁOWA KLUCZOWE chanson, rondeau, XV wiek, polifonia, Leuven Chansonnier, kontrafaktury, centrum, peryferie, Firminus Caron, *Helas*

Chanson scholarship often distrusts fifteenth-century Italian or Central European sources that transmit contrafacta.¹ Manuscripts from France or the Low Countries enjoy higher status partly because their texts are presumed authentic. Attempts at countering this imbalance have valorised musical readings of peripheral sources, datable watermarks or the preservation of chansons absent from central sources. David J. Burn suggests another approach to the centre/periphery dichotomy, namely that the critical scrutiny usually reserved for peripheries be applied also to centres.² In this spirit, my article investigates possible vernacular contrafacta in a recently discovered central source, the Leuven Chansonnier (Leuven, Alamire Foundation, MS 1; hereafter 'LC').³

The LC is dated to c.1470–75 through its concordances with five roughly contemporaneous songbooks, the Copenhagen, Dijon, Laborde, Nivelles and Wolfenbüttel chansonniers (hereafter 'Cop', 'Dij', 'Lab', 'Niv' and 'Wolf'; see Appendix 1 for full source designations).⁴ The specific origins of all six central chansonniers are contested, but the consensus is that they were copied in central France, near many of their composers.⁵ The LC contains one Latin piece, Walter Frye's *Ave regina celorum*, thought to be a contrafactum of a lost English ballade.⁶ Our songbook

I wrote this article for the project *Lost in Translation? Multilingualism in Early Song, 1350–1550* (KU Leuven and Alamire Foundation). I presented the material on 23 October 2023 at the conference *Contrafact in the Middle Ages* organised by the Masaryk Institute and Archives of the Czech Academy of Sciences. The article is partly based on Ryan O'Sullivan, *The Leuven Chansonnier: Provenance, Transmission, and Authorships*, KU Leuven 2024 (PhD dissertation), pp. 104–107 and 173–178.

- 1 Contrafacture in Florentine chansonniers, for instance, was taken as tarnishing their attributive reliability in Joshua Rifkin, 'Busnoys and Italy: The Evidence of Two Songs', in: *Antoine Busnoys: Method, Meaning, and Context in Late Medieval Music*, ed. Paula Higgins, Oxford 1999, pp. 510–518.
- 2 David J. Burn, 'Central and Peripheral Musical Traditions in the Low Countries in the Earlier Sixteenth Century', *Journal of the Alamire Foundation* 15 (2023) no. 2, pp. 193–199, doi.org/10.1484/J.JAF.5.135280.
- 3 David J. Burn, 'The Leuven Chansonnier: A New Source for Mid Fifteenth-Century Franco-Flemish Polyphonic Song', *Journal of the Alamire Foundation* 9 (2017) no. 1, pp. 135–158, doi.org/10.1484/J.JAF.5.114052; David J. Burn, *Leuven Chansonnier: Study*, Antwerp 2017 (= Leuven Library of Music in Facsimile 1).
- 4 The abbreviations derive from David Fallows, *A Catalogue of Polyphonic Songs, 1415–1480*, Oxford 1999.
- 5 The LC's securely ascribed chansons are all by composers active in France or the Low Countries. Recent views of the six central chansonniers' specific origins appear in Jane Alden, *Songs, Scribes, and Society: The History and Reception of the Loire Valley Chansonniers*, Oxford–New York 2010, pp. 120–123; D. Burn, 'The Leuven Chansonnier', pp. 141–144; D. Burn, *Leuven Chansonnier: Study*, pp. 36–44; R. O'Sullivan, *The Leuven Chansonnier*, pp. 7–39; Ryan O'Sullivan, 'The Leuven Chansonnier's Early Provenance', *Journal of the Alamire Foundation* 16 (2024) no. 2, pp. 281–311, doi.org/10.1484/J.JAF.5.142078.
- 6 Sylvia Kenney, 'Contrafacta in the Works of Walter Frye', *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 8 (1955) no. 3, pp. 182–202, doi.org/10.2307/829688; Sylvia Kenney, *Walter Frye and the 'contenance angloise'*, New Haven 1964, pp. 62–78; Reinhard Strohm, *The Rise of European Music, 1380–1500*, Cambridge 1993, p. 397; *Secular Polyphony 1380–1480*, ed. David Fallows, London 2014 (= Musica Britannica 97), p. 262.

transmits forty-nine French songs, all of whose texts might at first glance appear authentic, but we will see below that two are probably contrafacta or originally instrumental works: Firminus Caron's *Helas que pourra devenir* and the anonymous *Aime qui voudra*.

The complex evidentiary situation surrounding Caron's song has long divided opinion. Some scholars consider *Helas que pourra devenir* the original text. My weighing of the text-critical and stylistic arguments suggests otherwise. Peter Woetmann Christoffersen recently designated the rondeau cinquain *Aime qui voudra* a contrafactum or originally instrumental piece, viewing the music as a possible fragmentary virelai.⁷ Based partly on a previously overlooked structural similarity to Caron's *Helas*, I argue instead that the anonymous song was composed for an unknown rondeau quatrain.

Whereas bilingual contrafacture is explicable through varying linguistic preferences, the motivations behind monolingual contrafacture are less obvious. The text of Caron's *Helas* may have been switched accidentally. *Aime qui voudra* looks like a more deliberate product. However they arose, these case studies signal that not only peripheries but also centres must be scrutinised for contrafacture and *post factum* texting of originally instrumental works.

CARON'S *HELAS*

Extant in twenty-three notated sources, *Helas* was a 'hit song'. It became known to modern musicology primarily through François-Joseph Fétis and August Wilhelm Ambros, who praised Caron's elegant voice-leading.⁸ The chanson contains a virtuosic cross-rhythm section (beginning in bar 16 of Appendix 2) now seen as a milestone in the development of pervasive imitation.⁹ *Helas que pourra devenir* is far from the only text transmitted with this music. As shown in Table 1, the song accrued no fewer than seven distinguishable titles.

7 *The Copenhagen Chansonnier and the 'Loire Valley' Chansonniers: An Open Access Project*, ed. Peter Woetmann Christoffersen, 2013–25, <https://chansonniers.pwch.dk/CH/CH128.html>, accessed 7 July 2025.

8 François-Joseph Fétis, *Biographie universelle des musiciens et bibliographie générale de la musique*, Paris 1861, 2nd ed., vol. 2, p. 194; August Wilhelm Ambros, *Geschichte der Musik*, Leipzig 1880, 2nd ed., vol. 2, p. 469.

9 Julie Cumming, 'From Variety to Repetition: The Birth of Imitative Polyphony', *Yearbook of the Alamire Foundation* 6 (2008), pp. 31–35.

Table 1. Concordances for F. Caron, *Helas***3vv:**

Augsburg25	fol. 4r (No. 7), incipit only 'Dess mayen lust', opening of discantus absent
BQ16	fols. 128v–129r (No. 110), incipit only 'Elas que pour devenir'
Bratislava	No. 1, text 'Myt treuen herzen', discantus and tenor only, down a fourth
Col	fols. G3v–4r [now fols. 39v–40r] (No. 49), incipit only 'Hellas'
Dij	fols. 78v–79r [new fols. 81v–82r] (No. 69), full text 'Helas que pourra devenir', 'Caron'
F229	fols. 222v–223r (No. 206), one stanza only 'Helas que pourra devenir', 'Caron'
Glog	fols. A3v/A3v/A3v (No. 8), superscription 'Der föchtß seyden schwantcz', text 'Ave sydus clarissimum'
Lab1	fols. 12v–13r (No. 4), full text 'Helas m'amour' (also in Roh, No. 456, fol. 156v), 'Caron'
LC	fols. 61v–63r (No. 39), full text 'Helas que pourra devenir'
P676	fols. 12v–13r (No. 5), incipit only 'Helas que pora advenire'
Per431	fols. 59v–60r (No. 37), incipit only 'Helas'
Pix	fols. 33v–34r (No. 30), one stanza only 'Hella que pourra devenir'
RCas	fols. 45v–46r (No. 38), incipit only 'Hellas mon cœur', 'Caron'
RCG	fols. 71v–72r (No. 58), incipit only 'Hellas', 'Caron'
Tr89	fols. 416v–417r (No. 770), textless
Uppsala76a	fols. 13v–14r (No. 16), one stanza only 'Helas que pourra devenir'
Verona757	fols. 19v–20r (No. 20), textless
Wolf	fols. 49v–50r (No. 40), full text 'Helas que pourra devenir'

4vv:

BQ18	fols. 35v–36r (No. 35), incipit only 'Helafo'
F27	fols. 35v–36r (No. 56), incipit only 'Helas', 'Caron'
Odh	fols. 15v–16r (No. 13), incipit only 'Helas que pourra devenir', 'Caron'
Segovia	fols. 114v–115r (No. 43), incipit only 'Elaes', 'Caron'

Tablature:

Baena	fols. 30r–31r (No. 34), incipit only 'Helas qui porra', down a fourth, 'Caron'
-------	--

Text only:

Roh	fols. 130r–130v (No. 344), full text 'Helas que pourra devenir'
-----	---

A handful of sources are textless or have a unique incipit, superscription or text in German or Latin. The incipit 'Helas mon cuer' and the full text 'Helas m'amour' are each transmitted uniquely. Ten sources have the incipit or text 'Helas que pourra devenir'. Heinrich Isaac's reworking has the incipit 'Helas que de vera mon cuer' in one source.¹⁰ Johannes Tinctoris's homage to Caron's song is titled 'Elaes abraham' in one source and 'Helas le bon temps que j'avoie' in another.¹¹ A homage with conflicting ascriptions to Alexander Agricola and Pietrequin Bonnel has the title 'Helas ma dame que feraige'.¹² Even if some of the reworkings were deliberately renamed, it is easy to see how different poems beginning with the same word could have been accidentally mixed up in transmission. The possible texts for Caron's *Helas* must be investigated in turn.

The composer's biography speaks against his writing *Helas* for a German text. He is explicitly documented from 1459–75 in Amiens, where his family was established already decades previously.¹³ *Helas* was copied into Tr89 and Bratislava on paper from c.1460–63 and c.1465 respectively, suggesting composition around 1460 or earlier.¹⁴

10 *A Florentine Chansonnier from the Time of Lorenzo the Magnificent: Florence, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale MS Banco Rari 229*, ed. Howard Mayer Brown, Chicago–London 1983, Text vol., p. 209; Music vol., pp. 11–13. See also the analyses in Howard Mayer Brown, 'Emulation, Competition, and Homage: Imitation and Theories of Imitation in the Renaissance', *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 35 (1982) no. 1, pp. 15–21, doi.org/10.2307/831286; *The Cappella Giulia Chansonnier (Rome, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, C.G.XIII.27)*, ed. Allan Atlas, Brooklyn 1976, vol. 1, pp. 174–177.

11 *Helas le bon temps que j'avoie* is ascribed to 'Tintoris' in Odh and its derivative F27. An ascription to 'Loysette Compere' appears in Segovia. Although Segovia serves as a watchword for unreliability in Compere scholarship, it is an important authority on Tinctoris. The theorist's authorship of *Helas le bon temps que j'avoie* is ultimately favoured by stylistic considerations, see D. Fallows, *Catalogue of Polyphonic Songs*, p. 178; *Florence, BNC, Panciatichi 27: Text and Context*, ed. Gioia Filocamo, transl. Bonnie J. Blackburn, Turnhout 2010 (= Monumenta Musica Europea, Section II, Renaissance 1), pp. 439–440; Amanda Zuckerman Wesner, *The Chansons of Loyset Compère: Authenticity and Stylistic Development*, Harvard University 1992 (PhD dissertation), pp. 231–233. On the relationship between Caron's and Tinctoris's *Helas* songs, see *The Copenhagen Chansonnier*, https://chansonniers.pwch.dk/CH_X/Sev5-I-43_60.html, accessed 16 July 2024.

12 *Alexandri Agricola (1446–1506): Opera omnia*, vol. 5, ed. Edward R. Lerner, s.l. 1970 (= Corpus Mensuralis Musicae 22), pp. xciv–xcv and 125–127; D. Fallows, *Catalogue of Polyphonic Songs*, p. 179.

13 Rob C. Wegman, 'Fremin le Caron at Amiens: New Documents', in: *Essays on Renaissance Music in Honour of David Fallows: 'Bon jour, bon mois et bonne estrenne'*, eds. Fabrice Fitch and Jacobijn Kiel, Woodbridge 2011, pp. 10–32.

14 The paper on which the song appears in Tr89 (fols. 416v–417r) is dated in Suparmi Elizabeth Saunders, *The Dating of the Trent Codices from their Watermarks: With a Study of the Local Liturgy of Trent in the Fifteenth Century*, University of London 1983 (PhD dissertation), p. 200; Peter Wright, 'Johannes Wiser's Paper and the Copying of his Manuscripts', in: *I codici musicali trentini: Nuove scoperte e nuovi orientamenti della ricerca*, ed. Peter Wright, Trent 1996, p. 37. Bratislava is dated in Paweł Gancarczyk, *Musica scripto: Kodeksy menzuralne II połowy XV wieku na wschodzie Europy Łacińskiej [Musica scripto. Mensural Codices in Eastern Latin Europe in the Second Half of the Fifteenth Century]*, Warsaw 2001, pp. 156 and 275. The composition of *Helas* is dated to the 1460s and c.1465 respectively in David Fallows, 'The Most Popular Songs of the Fifteenth Century', in: *The Cambridge History of Fifteenth-Century Music*, eds. Anna Maria Busse Berger and Jesse Rodin, Cambridge 2015, p. 795; Reinhard Strohm, 'Instrumentale Ensemblemusik vor 1500: Das Zeugnis der mitteleuropäischen Quellen', in: *Musik und Tanz zur Zeit Kaiser Maximilian I. Bericht über die am 21. und 22. Oktober 1989 in Innsbruck abgehaltene Fachtagung*, ed. Walter Salmen, Innsbruck 1992, pp. 94–95.

Some Franco-Flemish composers admittedly visited German-speaking lands.¹⁵ However, the possibility that Caron composed *Helas* for a German text during some hypothetical stay abroad in the 1450s is truly remote compared with the likelihood that his song was contrafacted in that language.

It is tempting to reject Glog's *Ave sydus clarissimum* as the original text for Caron's *Helas* out of hand because fifteenth-century contrafacture from Latin to French is vanishingly rare, but one possible analogy demands consideration. Howard Mayer Brown speculated that Antoine Busnoys's chansons *Je suis venue a mon amy* and *J'ay bien choisi* originated as parts of Glog's motet *O stella maris*.¹⁶ The French texts have an unusual *aabb* rhyme scheme and require peculiarly extensive melismas.¹⁷ However, they are supported by three sources, whereas the Latin text is unique to Glog. Its scribe, Abbot Martin Rinkenberg of the Augustine monastery in Žagaň, routinely copied chansons as contrafacta, so *O stella maris* is probably one of them.¹⁸ The same is true of *Ave sydus clarissimum*, which he set to Caron's *Helas*. Example 1 shows that the Latin text fits the first musical phrase well (bars 1–7). The busier second and third phrases are also workable (bars 8–15 and 16–23). However, the meagre text for the fourth phrase (bars 24–32) is out of balance with what preceded it. The combined evidence of transmission and style indicates that *Ave sydus clarissimum* is a contrafactum.

RCas's music was copied by Johannes Martini, but its texts were added by an error-prone southern hand.¹⁹ Its incipit 'Helas mon cuer' might have arisen from conflation with the virelai *Helas mon cuer helas mon oeil* or the LC's unicum *Helas*

- 15 One Franco-Flemish composer active in German-speaking lands is documented in Paweł Gancarczyk, 'Johannes Tourout and the Imperial *Hofkantorei* ca. 1460', *Hudební věda* 50 (2013) nos. 3–4, pp. 239–257.
- 16 *A Florentine Chansonnier*, Text vol., pp. 132–138. The Pixérécourt Chansonnier (Pix) ascribes *Je suis venue a mon amy* and *J'ay bien choisi* to Busnoys. RCas ascribes both to Hayne van Ghizeghem. Busnoys is the more stylistically convincing candidate, given these songs' extensive use of literal-minded imitation.
- 17 Antoine Busnoys, *Collected Works. Works with Texts in the Vernacular*, ed. Leeman L. Perkins, New York 2018 (= Masters and Monuments of the Renaissance 5), vol. 1A, pp. 222–232; vol. 1B, pp. 381–392.
- 18 Rinkenberg was identified as Glog's scribe in Paweł Gancarczyk, 'Abbot Martin Rinkenberg and the Origins of the "Glogauer Liederbuch"', *Early Music* 37 (2009) no. 1, pp. 27–36, doi.org/10.1093/em/can158. Chansons transmitted as contrafacta in Glog are listed in Jaap van Benthem, 'Die Saganer Stimmbücher (Das Glogauer Liederbuch): Eine unbeachtete Quelle für Johannes Tourout?', in: *The Musical Culture of Silesia before 1742: New Contexts – New Perspectives*, eds. Paweł Gancarczyk, Lenka Hlávková-Mráčková and Remigiusz Pośpiech, Frankfurt am Main 2013, pp. 78–79; Paweł Gancarczyk, 'The Former "Glogauer Liederbuch" and Early Partbooks: On the Origin and Function of a New Type of Musical Codex', *Tijdschrift van de Koninklijke Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis* 64 (2014) no. 1, pp. 39–40.
- 19 Joshua Rifkin, 'Munich, Milan, and a Marian Motet: Dating Josquin's *Ave Maria ... virgo serena*', *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 56 (2003) no. 2, pp. 318–319 n. 170, doi.org/10.1525/jams.2003.56.2.239; David Fallows, *Josquin*, Turnhout 2009, p. 68.

Ex. 1. F. Caron, *Helas*, discantus with texts from Labi, Glog, and the LC

(Lab1:) 1. Helas, m'amour, ma trespafete amye,
(Glog:) Ave sydus clarissimum,
(LC:) 1. Helas que pourra devenir

8
2. Si ne vous plaist m'estraindre vostre grace,
Templum Dei sanctissimum, Virtutum vas mundissimum, Maria mater pia Iherum Cristi.

16
2. Mon cuer, s'il ne peult parvenir 3. A celle haultaine entreprise,

24
3. Je ne requier heure, temps, ny espace
Ave gloriosa femina, Quae non per viri semina, Sed castitate gemina
4. Ou sa volenté est submise

4. De vivre plus, fors en merencolie.
Mater Dei fuiui.

5. Pour mieulx sur toutes advenir?

mon ♥ tu m'occiras.²⁰ Yet more probably, RCas's incipit is a conflation of the opening lines of *Helas que pourra devenir*, whose second line begins 'mon cuer'. The same goes for the 'Helas que de vera mon cuer' incipit of Isaac's reworking. Adding to these witnesses a citation by Pietro Aaron, we now have thirteen sources supporting the text *Helas que pourra devenir*.²¹

The majority reading for Caron's text thus enjoys formidable backing. The alternative, Labi's *Helas m'amour*, survives in only one notated chansonnier. There is no musical reading suggesting Labi's stemmatic superiority over the other sources. Rather, Labi varies with the French chansonniers Dij, Uppsala76a, and Wolf, while the LC is an outlier in terms of musical transmission.²² Under normal circumstances, the massive text-critical evidence supporting *Helas que pourra devenir* would prove its authenticity, overwhelming any stylistic considerations. Yet in *Helas* there is a stylistic argument of such force as to challenge the evidence of transmission.

The decasyllabic rondeau quatrain *Helas m'amour* undeniably fits the music better than the octosyllabic rondeau cinquain *Helas que pourra devenir*.²³ The song is structured in four equal phrases. The cinquain poem squashes the second and third poetic lines into the second musical phrase, which has no internal cadence (bars 8–15). Fifteenth-century chanson composers usually set one line of text to one musical

20 The former possibility is suggested in Arthur S. Wolff, *The Chansonnier Biblioteca Casanatense 2856: Its History, Purpose, and Music*, North Texas State University, Denton 1970 (PhD dissertation), vol. 1, pp. 234–235.

21 'Helasque pourra di Caron' is mentioned as being in the fifth tone in Pietro Aaron, *Trattato della natura et cognitione di tutti gli tuoni*, Venice 1525, §6.

22 R. O'Sullivan, *The Leuven Chansonnier*, pp. 174–176.

23 James C. Thomson, *The Works of Caron: A Study in Fifteenth-Century Style*, New York University 1959 (PhD dissertation), vol. 1, pp. 226–227; Duff James Kennedy, *Six chansonniers français: The Central Sources of the Franco-Burgundian Chanson*, University of California, Santa Barbara 1987 (PhD dissertation), pp. 160–161.

phrase.²⁴ Admittedly, note-to-syllable alignment evaporated around the middle of the century, when scribes gave up copying text first and spacing the music to align notes with specific syllables.²⁵ Except at the beginnings and ends of phrases, syllable deployment was decided by singers.²⁶ Nonetheless, composers retained clear ideas about the overall correspondence of textual lines and musical phrases. Songs containing four equal musical phrases generally have quatrain poems.

Recent opinions on Caron's song have varied. Clemens Goldberg believed *Helas que pourra devenir* the original text.²⁷ Martella Gutiérrez-Denhoff and Peter Woetmann Christoffersen instead considered *Helas m'amour* authentic.²⁸ David Fallows posited a textless genesis.²⁹ After unpicking the arguments, I will support Gutiérrez-Denhoff's and Christoffersen's view.

Goldberg erroneously claimed that *Helas m'amour* is unique to Labi, overlooking its concordance in the poetry album Roh.³⁰ He argued that the poem was written especially for Labi using words from Johannes Ockeghem's *Ma maistresse* such as 'amy', 'parfaicte', 'desir', 'm'amour', 'heure', 'vivre', 'helas' and 'si ne vous plaist', based on an assumption that Ockeghem's song is the intertextual centrepiece of Lab's opening chanson group.³¹ However, even if the poet of *Helas m'amour* intended

24 *Chansonnier de Jean de Montchenu* (Bibliothèque nationale, Rothschild 2973 [I.5.13]), eds. David Fallows and Geneviève Thibault, Paris 1991, p. xl; David Fallows, 'Texting in the Chansonnier of Jean de Montchenu', in: *Songs and Musicians in the Fifteenth Century*, ed. David Fallows, Aldershot 1996, p. 6.

25 Lawrence Earp, 'Texting in 15th-Century French Chansons: A Look Ahead from the 14th Century', *Early Music* 19 (1991) no. 2, p. 197, doi.org/10.1093/earlyj/XIX.2.195.

26 Honey Meconi, 'Is Underlay Necessary?', in: *Companion to Medieval and Renaissance Music*, eds. Tess Knighton and David Fallows, New York 1992, p. 287.

27 Clemens Goldberg, *Das Chansonnier Laborde: Studien zur Intertextualität einer Liederhandschrift des 15. Jahrhunderts*, Frankfurt am Main 1997 (= Quellen und Studien zur Musikgeschichte von der Antike bis in die Gegenwart 36), p. 71; Clemens Goldberg, 'Reading Laborde: The Significance of Johannes Ockeghem's Chansons in the Context of the Chansonnier Laborde', in: *Johannes Ockeghem: Actes du XLe Colloque international d'études humanistes, Tours 3–8 février 1997*, ed. Philippe Vendrix, Paris 1998 (= Quellen und Studien zur Musikgeschichte von der Antike bis in die Gegenwart 36), pp. 256–263.

28 Martella Gutiérrez-Denhoff, *Der Wolfenbütteler Chansonnier: Wolfenbüttel, Herzog August Bibliothek Codex Guelf. 287 Extrav. Untersuchungen zu Repertoire und Überlieferung einer Musikhandschrift des 15. Jahrhunderts und ihres Umkreises*, Wiesbaden 1985 (= Wolfenbütteler Forschungen 29), p. 168. See P.W. Christoffersen's comments at *The Copenhagen Chansonnier*, <https://chansonniers.pwch.dk/CH/CH092.html>, accessed 16 July 2024.

29 D. Fallows, 'The Most Popular Songs', p. 797.

30 C. Goldberg, *Das Chansonnier Laborde*, p. 70. Roh's concordance for *Helas m'amour* was noted in J.C. Thomson, *The Works of Caron*, vol. 1, p. 225. The concordance is not mentioned in *Der Wolfenbütteler Chansonnier: Herzog August Bibliothek Codex Guelf. 287 Extrav.*, ed. Martella Gutiérrez-Denhoff, Mainz 1988 (= Musikalische Denkmäler 10), p. 138.

31 C. Goldberg, *Das Chansonnier Laborde*, p. 71. Goldberg's transcription of *Helas m'amour* contains the line 'tout ce que voys me desplaist et ennoye', but the Rohan and Laborde chansonniers do not transmit this text. Goldberg stated 'the text in Laborde does not fit the music, because the first stanza contains one line too many' ('Der Text in Laborde ist nicht passend zur Musik der Chanson verfaßt, da er in seiner ersten Strophe einen Vers zu viel enthält'), presumably confusing *Helas m'amour* with *Helas que pourra devenir*.

the intertextualities, this does not prove that the poem was written specifically for Lab. Multiple scholars, including Goldberg, have independently contended that the second section of *Helas* contains a musical allusion to *Ma maistresse*.³² If anything, textual allusions to Ockeghem's song, if we were to accept them, would support the authenticity of *Helas m'amour* because they accord with the purported musical allusion.

There are good reasons for rejecting Goldberg's view of the relationship between *Helas* and *Ma maistresse* altogether, since his proposed allusions are generally little more than individual non-rhyme words and a series of pitches stripped of rhythmic content. Poets normally use entire lines or significant rhyme words when citing their fellows, and Caron may have chosen a standard melodic pattern permitting immediate imitation at the fifth without intending any reference to *Ma maistresse*.³³ Regardless of whether we accept the intertextualities as consciously intended or not, Goldberg's claim that *Helas m'amour* was written for Lab appears ill-founded.

Gutiérrez-Denhoff's and Christoffersen's view that *Helas m'amour* is the poem set by Caron relies on its line-phrase balance, which is superior to that of *Helas que pourra devenir*. Admittedly, the musical phrases seem overly long and busy even for decasyllabic lines. However, difficulty is inherent to the song's character. *Helas* is virtuosic in terms of not only composition and performance but also copying. The tenor and contratenor contain approximately three hundred notes, an unusually large total, so accommodating them on a single leaf is no mean feat.³⁴

Fallows claimed that the song's 'intricate cross-rhythms make it unsuitable for singing to text, and more importantly it lacks clear formal articulations'.³⁵ However, rhythmic simplicity and textual intelligibility were hardly ideals towards which songwriters of Caron's generation strove, and whilst the question of whether instrumentalists and singers performed together is moot, vocal solutions certainly exist.³⁶ Fallows is partly correct in saying that *Helas* lacks formal articulations. The sources

32 Christopher A. Reynolds, 'The Counterpoint of Allusion in Fifteenth-Century Masses', *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 45 (1992) no. 2, pp. 228–229 n. 1, <https://doi.org/10.2307/831448>; C. Goldberg, *Das Chansonnier Laborde*, p. 72; C. Goldberg, 'Reading Laborde', p. 260; Sean Gallagher, 'Cent mille escus, the *Ma maistresse* Complex, and the Leuven Chansonnier', *Journal of the Alamire Foundation* 17 (2025) no. 1, forthcoming, Fig. 3.

33 I am grateful to an anonymous reviewer for this observation.

34 Jane Alden, 'Forms of Intimacy: Miniaturisation and Sociability in the Fifteenth-Century Chansonnier', in: *The Media of Secular Music in the Medieval and Early Modern Period (1100–1650)*, eds. Vincenzo Borghetti and Alexandros Maria Hatzikiriakos, London 2024, pp. 120–124; J. Alden, *Songs, Scribes, and Society*, pp. 8 and 148.

35 D. Fallows, 'The Most Popular Songs', p. 797.

36 Huelgas Ensemble, *Firminus Caron: Twilight of the Middle Ages*, streaming audio, Deutsche Harmonia Mundi, 2016, <https://open.spotify.com/track/55HtKeFjTeh9ydTVXV3K3i?si=e28c90624f494714>, accessed 18 July 2024; The Sound and the Fury, *Firminus Caron: Complete Masses & Chansons*, vol. 3, streaming audio, Fra Bernardo, 2012, <https://open.spotify.com/track/0JUSPA9IP18TLWhgOiDL9Z?si=9c8f15b4891d4280>, accessed 18 July 2024.

transmit no fermatas or signs of congruence at the mid-point cadence in bar 15.³⁷ Some scribes were undoubtedly confused by that cadence's unusual pitch. Most rondeaux have non-tonic cadences at their mid-points, whereas both sections of *Helas* end on F. Meanwhile, Col, which may have been copied by Franchinus Gaffurius, incorrectly transmits fermatas at the cadence on A in bar 23.³⁸ Martini's copy in RCas has a page-turn at the same point.³⁹ However, the newly discovered LC correctly articulates the form of *Helas*, placing its page-turn after the cadence in bar 15.

The fact that the contratenor falls silent at this cadence's resolution does not prevent the juncture from serving as the mid-point. Fifteenth-century cadences were essentially dyadic.⁴⁰ As is well known, the standard chanson model at this time involved a discantus-tenor duet whose points of repose were offset by continued activity in the contratenor.⁴¹ Although contratenors most commonly accompanied the upper duet's cadences with 'octave leap', 'parallel fourths', 'rising fourth' or 'falling fifth' gestures, many rondeaux have mid-points where the contratenor falls briefly silent at the cadential resolution before continuing its forward momentum, including Caron's *O vie fortunee*, which is structured as a rondeau quatrain with cadences on C, F, A and C.⁴² I suggest viewing *Helas* similarly.

The objection that the contratenor's re-entry in bar 15 is not on the cadential resolution's root or the fifth above (the pitches that contratenors most commonly take) is unsustainable. Although the LC and most other sources have *a*, the French

37 The absence of fermatas and signs of congruence in reworkings of Caron's *Helas* was taken as evidence of instrumental performance in Jon Banks, *The Instrumental Consort Repertory of the Late Fifteenth Century*, Aldershot 2006, p. 83.

38 Col's copy of *Helas* on fols. G3v–4r [now fols. 39v–40r] is assigned to Scribe III in Stanley Boorman, 'Limitations and Extensions of Filiation Technique', in: *Music in Medieval and Early Modern Europe: Patronage, Sources and Texts*, ed. Iain Fenlon, Cambridge 1981, pp. 327. A tentative suggestion that this scribe is the theorist Franchinus Gaffurius appears in David Fallows, *Art Songs of the Burgundian Era, 1415–1480*. Oxford–New York, forthcoming. I am grateful to David Fallows for permitting me to see this part of his work before its publication.

39 An anonymous reviewer of this article suggested that Gaffurius and Martini may have had Caron's *Cent mille escus* in mind when situating the mid-point of *Helas* at the cadence on A in bar 23. I wonder whether this cadence instead stood out because its diminished fifth had been criticised by Johannes Tinctoris, *The Art of Counterpoint (Liber de arte contrapuncti)*, transl. Albert Seay, s.l. 1961 (= *Musico-logical Studies and Documents* 5), p. 130; Johannes Tinctoris, *Proportionale musices; Liber de arte contrapuncti*, ed. Gianluca D'Agostino, Florence 2008, pp. 358–361.

40 A late fifteenth-century treatise exemplifying fifty-two cadences, all specifying two parts only, is transcribed in *Scriptorum de musica medii aevi*, ed. Edmond de Coussemaker, Paris 1976, vol. 4, pp. 450–455. See the discussion in David Nicholas Fallows, *Robert Morton's Songs: A Study of Styles in the Mid-Fifteenth Century*, University of California, Berkeley 1978 (PhD dissertation), pp. 6–8 and 45–48.

41 This 'Standard Contratenor function' is described in D.N. Fallows, *Robert Morton's Songs*, pp. 52–53.

42 On *O vie fortunee*, whose corrupt text may be a contrafactum, see H.M. Brown, 'Emulation, Competition, and Homage', pp. 25–29; J.C. Thomson, *The Works of Caron*, vol. 1, pp. 254–259; *A Florentine Chansonnier*, Music vol., pp. 145–146. Rondeaux in the LC whose contratenors rest at the resolution of the mid-point cadence include Robert Morton's *Le souvenir*, Hayne's *De touz biens plaine* and the anonymous *Les trevez d'Amours*, *Escu d'ennuy* and *Quant je fus prins au pavillon*. Of Busnoys's rondeaux, see *En soustenant vostre querelle* and *Je m'esbais de vous*, edited in A. Busnoys, *Collected Works*, vol. 1A, pp. 62 and 69.

chansonniers Dij, Labi, Uppsala76a and Wolf have *f*, and Augsburg25, Glog, P676 and Tr89 have *c*.⁴³ In any event, the purpose of a rondeau's mid-point cadence is not to create a sense of finality but rather to lead elegantly to the second section or back to the beginning. The cadence in bar 15 fulfills these functions. Some songs whose status as rondeaux is undisputed have far more unusual mid-point cadences, such as Ockeghem's *Aultre Venus*, *Fors seullement contre*, *L'autre d'antan* and *Ung aultre l'a*.⁴⁴ By comparison, bar 15 of *Helas* looks conventional. Ockeghem's attitude to voice-leading in mid-point cadences seems to be matched by Caron only in *Seulette suis sans ami*, though its textual transmission leaves its status as a rondeau uncertain.⁴⁵

A small clue that *Helas* was intended for a decasyllabic poem is its semibreve rest in bar 4, which could mark the medial caesura that occurs after the fourth syllable of decasyllabic *formes fixes* poems.⁴⁶ Composers often break musical phrases at the medial caesura, sometimes with rests.⁴⁷ However, rests after a short opening motto are almost equally common in octosyllabic songs, which have no medial caesura.⁴⁸

Determining for which text Caron composed *Helas*, if any, depends ultimately on our weighing of the stylistic and text-critical evidence. I do not believe that Caron wrote four perfectly balanced musical phrases for a rondeau cinquain. Some decades ago, that might have seemed possible. Defective readings of songs such as *Cent mille escus* gave scholars the impression that he was a clumsy composer, but the LC's rediscovery proved that impression wrong.⁴⁹ Although the well-attested *Helas que pourra*

43 R. O'Sullivan, *The Leuven Chansonnier*, pp. 472–474. Example 39.2 on p. 174 contains minor inaccuracies.

44 Johannes Ockeghem, *Collected Works*, vol. 3, *Motets and Chansons*, eds. Richard Wexler and Dragan Plamenac, Boston 1992 (= Studies and Documents 7), pp. 59, 64–65, 71 and 92.

45 See the edition and discussions of *Seulette suis sans ami* in *Music from the Pixérécourt Manuscript: A Modern Edition of Twelve Compositions from Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, Ms. fonds français 15123*, ed. Edward Pease, Ann Arbor 1960, pp. 29–31; Edward Joseph Pease, *An Edition of the Pixérécourt Manuscript: Paris, Bibliothèque nationale, fonds fr. 15123*, Indiana University 1959 (PhD dissertation), vol. 2, pp. 68–70; D. Fallows, *Catalogue of Polyphonic Songs*, p. 369; Sean Gallagher, 'Caron and Florence: A New Ascription and the Copying of the Pixérécourt Chansonnier', in: *Recevez ce mien petit labeur: Studies in Renaissance Music in Honour of Ignace Bossuyt*, eds. Mark Delaere and Pieter Bergé, Leuven 2008, p. 86.

46 Treatises describing the caesura in decasyllabic poetry are transcribed in *Recueil d'arts de seconde rhétorique*, ed. Ernest Langlois, Paris 1902, pp. 237–238, 261, and 266–269; *Le grand et vrai art de pleine rhétorique de Pierre Fabri*, ed. Alexandre Héron, Rouen 1890, vol. 2, pp. 97–99 and 101.

47 Richard Wexler, *The Complete Works of Johannes Prioris*, New York University 1974 (PhD dissertation), p. 48; *A Florentine Chansonnier*, ed. H.M. Brown, Text vol., p. 171. Of the LC's fourteen decasyllabic chansons, four (29%) have rests after a short opening motto: Gilles Mureau's *Je ne fay plus*, Barbingant's *Au travail suis* and the anonymous *Ravy d'Amours* and *Henri Phlippet*.

48 Of the LC's thirty-four octosyllabic chansons, seven (21%) have rests after a short opening motto: Morton's *Le souvenir*, Caron's *Cent mille escus* and the anonymous *J'ay pris amours*, *Helas l'avoy je desservy*, *Quant je fus prins au pavillon*, *J'ay des semblans* and *Ce que ma bouche* (which has the same motto as Caron's *Helas*).

49 Ryan O'Sullivan, 'Musical Transmission Networks and the Leuven Chansonnier', *Journal of the Alamire Foundation* 17 (2025) no. 1, forthcoming, Ex. 5–6.

devenir could represent a mid-fifteenth-century loosening of line-phrase relationships, there is a strong probability that the LC's text is a contrafactum. Instrumental origin remains possible, but if indeed there was originally a poem involved, that poem was surely *Helas m'amour*.

AIME QUI VOULDRA

Though extant in just four sources, *Aime qui voudra* achieved wide dissemination. As well as being included in two French chansonniers, it was copied into Col in Naples and Glog in Žagaň (Table 2).⁵⁰ The pentasyllabic rondeau cinquain closes a section headed 'Ensuivent aucuns rondeaulx faictz par Molinet' in the poetry collection P172I.⁵¹ This blanket attribution indicates that the poem is by Jean Molinet, a chronicler, poet and possible composer active at the Burgundian court.⁵²

Table 2. Concordances for Anon., *Aime qui voudra*

Col	fols. M8v–9r [now fols. 94v–95r] (No. 112), incipit only 'Fuÿß schwamz'
Dij	fols. 138v–139r [new fols. 141v–142r] (No. 117), full text 'Aime qui voudra'
Glog	fols. B3/B2/B5 (No. 24), superscription 'Der fochß schwantß', text 'O lux luminis'
LC	fols. 18v–19r (No. 14), full text 'Aime qui voudra'
Text only:	
Jard	fol. 84r (No. 242), full text 'Ayme qui voudra'
P572	fol. 216r, full text 'Ayme qui voudra'
P1721	fol. 26v, full text 'Ayme qui voudra'
P1722	fol. 26r (No. 102), full text 'Ayme qui voudra'
P10262	fol. 298r, full text 'Ayme qui voudra'
Roh	fol. 195r (No. 620), full text 'Ame qui voudra'

50 *Aime qui voudra* was copied into Col by Scribe IIIa according to S. Boorman, 'Limitations and Extensions', p. 327. Although Boorman suggested that Scribe IIIa may represent a stage in the development of Scribe III, they are two different copyists, as noted in J. Rifkin, 'Busnoys and Italy', p. 546 n. 175.

51 P1721, fol. 25r, <https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/btv1b10720618g/f29.item>, accessed 25 June 2025. An incorrect modern attribution to Jean Marot (d. c.1526) was based on the poem's position in P10262 in a section devoted largely to him. See Gérard Defaux and Thierry Mantovani, *Jehan Marot: Les deux recueils*, Geneva 1999, pp. 211–212 and 512. P1721 is dated to the 1520s in Jean Robertet, *Œuvres*, ed. Margaret Zsuppán, Geneva 1970, pp. 11–15.

52 *Les faictz et dictz de Jean Molinet*, ed. Noël Dupire, Paris 1937, vol. 2, p. 877. Molinet is the possible composer of *Tart ara mon cuer sa plaisance*, see D. Fallows, *Catalogue of Polyphonic Songs*, pp. 382–383 and 708–709.

Glog's superscription 'Der fochß schwantß' is typical of that source, but the title's transmission in Col is curious. Whereas German was used in Žagań, it had minimal currency in Naples. Two other songs in Col have titles concordant with Glog, *Nicht lasz mich hart entgelten* and *O herzens trost*, indicating the sources' close relatedness.⁵³ This might be explained by politics c.1480, when Col and Glog were produced. The marriage in 1476 of King Ferdinand I of Naples's daughter, Beatrice of Aragon, to the King of Hungary, Matthias Corvinus, encouraged cultural exchange between Naples and Central Europe.

It comes as no surprise, then, that the musical transmission of *Aime qui vouldra* is bipartite. The LC and Dij share readings differing significantly from those of Col and Glog (see the footnotes in Appendix 3). As for the texts, whilst Glog's *O lux luminis* can be set aside as typical of Rinkenbergs's contrafacture, we cannot dismiss the possibility that the anonymous music originated as an instrumental piece.⁵⁴ Dragan Plamenac saw *Aime qui vouldra* as the original text.⁵⁵ Christoffersen argued that this pentasyllabic rondeau cinquain's textual lines are generally too short for the musical phrases, suggesting that the potential for a neatly syllabic opening motivated the poem's *post factum* setting to an originally instrumental composition (Ex. 2).⁵⁶ He alternatively suggested that the music might be the refrain of a four-line virelai whose couplet was lost in transmission, citing the tonic mid-point cadence as unsuitable for a rondeau.

Ex. 2. Anon., *Aime qui vouldra*, discantus with texts from the LC and Glog

(LC:) 1. Aime qui vouldra
(Glog:) O lux luminis,

2. Le mieulx qu'il pourra.
splendor etiam syderis,

3. Ce n'est que soussi
Illumina nos in tenebris,

4. Car jamays sans sy
Ut mandati a vitis

5. Amours ne sera.
Celi fruamur deliciis.

Yet Christoffersen overlooked something when assessing the form of *Aime qui vouldra*: the anonymous song's cadential destinations C, F, A and F (bars 5, 11, 17

53 Paweł Gancarczyk, 'The Neapolitan Repertory in the Glogauer Liederbuch', *Musicology Today* 1 (2004), p. 41; D. Fallows, *Catalogue of Polyphonic Songs*, pp. 472 and 474.

54 P. Gancarczyk, 'The Former "Glogauer Liederbuch"', p. 39.

55 Dragan Plamenac, 'A Reconstruction of the French Chansonniere in the Biblioteca Colombina, Seville – I', *The Musical Quarterly* 37 (1951) no. 4, p. 528, doi.org/10.1093/mq/XXXVII.4.501.

56 *The Copenhagen Chansonniere*, <http://chansonniere.pwch.dk/CH/CH128.html>, accessed 16 July 2024.

and 26) are exactly those of Caron's *Helas* (bars 7, 15, 23 and 32), a probable rondeau quatrain. At first glance, this structural similarity might be taken to suggest emulation or shared authorship, as might the opening imitative triadic materials (see Appendices 2–3). Similarities between *Helas* and *Aime qui voudra* apparently also struck Rinkenberg, who frequently named songs after animals' body parts.⁵⁷ Unusually, he gave both songs the same title, 'Der fochß schwantß' ('the fox tail'), before replacing 'fochß' with 'seyden' ('silk') in Caron's piece ('Der seyden schwantß' is the German name for the Bohemian waxwing). The only other piece that Rinkenberg named 'Der fochß schwantß' is an anonymous reworking of *Aime qui voudra*, so he might well have thought the original *Aime qui voudra* an homage to Caron's *Helas*.⁵⁸

However, the identical cadential destinations, triadic openings and titles in Glog are insufficient to prove common authorship or emulation. *Aime qui voudra* proceeds freely after its opening, without the sustained reliance on canon that characterises *Helas*. Hearing the anonymous song does not bring Caron to mind.⁵⁹ The only moment recalling him is the beginning of the final line, where three-voice imitation is initiated by the contratenor in bars 17–20. Despite structural and thematic affinities between Caron's *Helas* and *Aime qui voudra*, the latter is removed from his style.⁶⁰

Given the limited cadential goals available to composers writing songs with a final on F, the two songs' overlap does not demonstrate conscious emulation. This notwithstanding, if *Helas* is a rondeau quatrain, as Christoffersen accepts, we need not view *Aime qui voudra* as a fragmentary virelai. A sizeable minority of rondeaux have tonic mid-point cadences.⁶¹ Given its musical structure, the music of *Aime qui*

57 Examples include 'Pfawn schwantcz' ('peacock tail'), 'Dy katzen phfote' ('the cat paw'), 'Der kranch schnabil' ('the crane beak') and 'Der pawir schwantcz' ('the pheasant tail'). Reinhard Strohm has suggested that 'schwanz' can be understood as deriving from 'schanzen', i.e. 'tanzen' ('dance'), and that the German titles were created not in Žagań but in Leipzig, see R. Strohm, 'Instrumentale Ensemblesmusik', pp. 94–95 and 101 n. 21.

58 The reworking is discussed in *The Copenhagen Chansonnier*, <https://chansonniers.pwch.dk/CH/CH559.html>, accessed 16 August 2024. Glog's Nos. 24 and 122 (*Aime qui voudra* and its anonymous reworking) are the only pieces listed as bearing the incipit in question in the alphabetical index in *Das Glogauer Liederbuch*, vol. 4, ed. Christian Väterlein, Kassel 1981 (= *Das Erbe deutscher Musik* 86), p. 397.

59 Sollazzo Ensemble, *Leuven Chansonnier, vol. 3 & 4: Le cuer vous demeure*, vol. 4, streaming audio, Pasacaille 2024, <https://open.spotify.com/track/2E6lxkWVTyOOyIUdXwM6I?si=701093194feb4031>, accessed 23 July 2024.

60 Robert Morton and Johannes Pullois are suggested as possible composers in R. Strohm, 'Instrumentale Ensemblesmusik', p. 94. Molinet himself is another possibility, though comparison of *Aime qui voudra* with his only ascribed song, *Tart ara mon cuer sa plaisance*, does nothing to encourage such a suggestion.

61 Not including *Aime qui voudra*, the LC contains forty-two rondeaux, nine (21%) of which have tonic mid-point cadences: *Puis qu'a vous servir, Oublie oublie, Nul ne me doit de ce blasmer*, Barbingant's *Esperant que mon bien vendra, La plus dolente*, Caron's *Helas, Ravy d'Amours, Quant je fus prins au pavillon* and *Henri Phlipet*. The possibility of performing such songs with one-line refrains is raised in Howard Mayer Brown, 'A "New" Chansonnier of the Early Sixteenth Century in the University Library of Uppsala: A Preliminary Report', *Musica Disciplina* 37 (1983), pp. 181–182.

vouldra was probably written for a rondeau quatrain, with the discantus's rest in bar 2 possibly marking a caesura in the first line, just like the rest in bar 4 of *Helas*. Although the possibility of textless origin cannot be ruled out, the music's four-phrase structure is clear. *Aime qui vouldra* is a likely contrafactum.

CONCLUSION

This article has identified two likely vernacular contrafacta in the LC. This count may be a low estimate, because virtually any fifteenth-century *forme fixe* chanson text could replace another of the same formal, linear and metrical disposition without raising musicological suspicions. Given the absence of syllable-to-note specificity in the sources, stylistic grounds for identifying vernacular contrafacta are limited to line-to-phrase incongruities.

My count of two vernacular contrafacta in the LC might instead be a high estimate. I argued that *Helas* and *Aime qui vouldra* were composed as rondeaux quatrains, but textless origins cannot be ruled out. Whether texting of originally instrumental music can be described as contrafacture is questionable. 'Kontrafaktur' was introduced to musicology by Friedrich Gennrich, who ultimately defined it as 'the process of adapting a song [text] to a pre-existent melody', but the word now strictly implies the substitution of the text of a piece of vocal music by another text.⁶² My conclusion that the LC contains two vernacular contrafacta is therefore provisional. What is beyond much doubt is that at least two of the songbook's texts are inauthentic.

The motivations and causes of monolingual contrafacture undoubtedly varied. The practice apparently occurred in Italy when scribes using untexted or partially texted musical exemplars copied the wrong poem, so this situation may also have arisen in France and the Low Countries, albeit less frequently.⁶³ Mishap is the most likely reason why Caron's *Helas* became *Helas que pourra devenir. Aime qui vouldra*

62 Friedrich Gennrich, *Musikwissenschaft und romanische Philologie: Ein Beitrag zur Bewertung der Musik als Hilfswissenschaft der romanischen Philologie*, Halle an der Saale 1918; F. Gennrich, 'Die Musik als Hilfswissenschaft der romanischen Philologie', *Zeitschrift für romanische Philologie* 39 (1919), pp. 330–361; F. Gennrich, *Die Kontrafaktur im Liedschaffen des Mittelalters*, Langen bei Frankfurt 1965, p. 5. For a typical modern understanding of the term, see Marina Toffetti, 'Contrafacere. Re-textualizing Polyphonic Music from the Late Sixteenth to the Seventeenth Century', in: *Contrafacta: Modes of Music Re-textualization in the Late Sixteenth and Seventeenth Century*, eds. Marina Toffetti and Gabriele Taschetti, Kraków 2020, p. 10. On the development of the term's meaning, see Robert Falck, 'Parody and Contrafactum: A Terminological Clarification', *The Musical Quarterly* 65 (1979) no. 1, pp. 1–21, doi.org/10.1093/mq/LXV.1.1; Markus Grassl, 'Kontrafaktur – Borrowing – Intertextualität: Stationen der musikwissenschaftlichen Auseinandersetzung', in: *Kontrafakturen im Kontext*, ed. Agnese Pavanello, Basel 2020 (= Basler Beiträge zur Historischen Musikpraxis 40), pp. 25–51.

63 The contrafacture of Busnoys's *Amours me tient using Faites de moy* is described in J. Rifkin, 'Busnoys and Italy', p. 518. Another example is the contrafacture of Mureau's *Je ne fâys plus using Au joly mois de may*, on which see A. Busnoys, *Collected Works*, vol. 1B, p. 289. The French language's status south of the Alps is described in David Fallows, 'French as a Courtly Language in Fifteenth-Century Italy: The Musical Evidence', *Renaissance Studies* 3 (1989) no. 4, pp. 429–441.

has a felicitously neat opening, so the probability that it was created knowingly is stronger. I identified structural similarities between these two songs, suggesting that both originally had the same textual form.

Optimism that the vast majority of chanson texts are authentic is encouraged by the rare survival of alternate French texts. Of the 155 chansons in Cop, Dij, Lab, the LC, Niv or Wolf with at least one texted concordance, only fifteen songs have full-stanza variants.⁶⁴ The variants are almost all short or long strophes rather than refrains. Ten songs have their alternate stanzas in text-only sources, whose musical applicability is uncertain.⁶⁵ Of the five remaining songs, only Caron's *Helas* has variants for all lines of its text. The rondeau quatrain *O infame desleauté* has independent texts from its fourth line onwards. Second and/or third stanzas were replaced in *Cent mille escus*, *Tout a par moy* and *La saison en est*.

Although text-only collections are uncertain records of musical performance, the sources' generally freer treatment of short and long strophes than of refrains demands explanation. In a certain sense, the first stanza is the true original. Reuse of its music for subsequent stanzas is in itself a sort of contrafacture.⁶⁶ This may explain why thirteen songs from the central chansonniers survive with substituted second or third stanzas, whereas alternate first stanzas are much rarer. Second and third stanzas may have been viewed as replaceable in a similar sense to contratenors, the first stanza being seen as a song's textual essence just as the discantus-tenor duet was its musical core.

Although individual stanzas were replaced occasionally, full-scale monolingual contrafacture appears truly exceptional. Nonetheless, vernacular contrafacta may be more common than the transmission picture suggests, given that approximately one third of chansons in the central sources are unica, and dozens more songs have concordances only in those interrelated sources. My findings suggest that other central chansonniers should be scrutinised in the way I have approached the LC. By interrogating the line-to-phrase correspondence of chansons transmitted in centres as well as those surviving in peripheries, we can reach a more balanced view of the witnesses to fifteenth-century song.

64 S. Gallagher, 'Cent mille escus', Table 1.

65 *De vous servir, Je ne seray plus vert vestu, Je serviray selon, La despourvue, Laissez Dangier, Le souvenir, Ma damoiselle ma maistresse, N'aray je jamais mieulx, Non pas que je veuille* and *Se je garde bien vostre bonneur*.

66 Ursula Aarburg, 'Melodien zum frühen deutschen Minnesang: Eine kritische Bestandsaufnahme', in: *Der deutsche Minnesang: Aufsätze zu seiner Erforschung*, ed. Hans Fromm, Darmstadt 1963 (= Wege der Forschung 15), p. 385. Aarburg's comment echoes the definition of 'parodie' in Jean-Jacques Rousseau, *Dictionnaire de musique*, Paris 1768, pp. 367–368.

APPENDIX I

Source abbreviations

Augsburg ²⁵	Augsburg, Staats- und Stadtbibliothek, 4° Cod. mus. 25
Baena	Gonzalo de Baena, <i>Arte novamente inventada para aprender a táger</i> (Lisbon: Germão Galharde, 1540)
BQ16	Bologna, Museo Internazionale e Biblioteca della Musica, Ms. Q16
BQ18	Bologna, Museo Internazionale e Biblioteca della Musica, Ms. Q18
Bratislava	Bratislava, Miestne Pracovisko Matice Slovenskej, Inc. 33 (lost) and Bratislava, Univerzitná Knižnica, Inc. 318-I ('The Kassa Fragments')
Col	Seville, Biblioteca Capitular y Colombina, Ms. 5-1-43; forty-two leaves now in PCI ('Colombina Chansonnier' or 'Seville Chansonnier')
Cop	Copenhagen, Det Kongelige Bibliotek, Ms. Thott 291 8° ('Copenhagen Chansonnier')
Dij	Dijon, Bibliothèque municipale, Ms. 517 ('Dijon Chansonnier')
F27	Florence, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale, Panciatichi 27
F229	Florence, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale, Ms. Banco Rari 229
Glog	Kraków, Biblioteka Jagiellońska (formerly Berlin, Preußische Staatsbibliothek), Mus. ms. 40098 ('Glogauer Liederbuch' or 'Saganer Stimmbücher' or 'Žagań Partbooks')
Jard	<i>Le jardin de plaisance et fleur de rethoricque</i> (Paris: Vérard, 1501)
Lab	Washington DC, Library of Congress, Ms. M2.1 L25 Case ('Laborde Chansonnier')
Lab1	Lab, Nos. 1–47, 51–58, 96 and 99, three further songs indexed but now absent
LC	Leuven, Alamire Foundation, Ms. 1 ('Leuven Chansonnier')
Niv	Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, Département de la Musique, Rés. Vmc Ms. 57 ('Nivelle Chansonnier')
Odh	<i>Harmonice musices odhecaton A</i> (Venice: Petrucci, 1501 etc.)
P572	Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, f. fr. 572
P676	Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, Département de Musique (Fonds du Conservatoire), Rés. Vm ⁷ 676
P1721	Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, f. fr. 1721
P1722	Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, f. fr. 1722
P10262	Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, nouv. acq. fr. 10262
PCI	Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, nouv. acq. fr. 4379, fols. 1r–42v
Per ⁴³¹	Perugia, Biblioteca Comunale Augusta, Ms. 431
Pix	Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, f. fr. 15123 ('Pixérécourt Chansonnier')
Rcas	Rome, Biblioteca Casanatense, Ms. 2856 ('Casanatense Chansonnier')
RCG	(Rome) Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Cappella Giulia, XIII.27 ('Cappella Giulia Chansonnier' or 'Medici Chansonnier')

Roh	Berlin, Staatliche Museen der Stiftung Preußischer Kulturbesitz, Kupferstichkabinett, Ms. 78.B.17
Segovia	Segovia, Archivo Capítular de la Catedral, Ms. s.s.
Tr89	Trent, Castello del Buonconsiglio, Monumenti e Collezioni Provinciali (formerly Museo Provinciale d'Arte), Ms. 89 (now 1376)
Uppsala76a	Uppsala, Universitetsbiblioteket, Ms. Vokalmusik i Handschrift 76a
Verona757	Verona, Biblioteca Capitolare, Ms. DCCLVII
Wolf	Wolfenbüttel, Herzog August Bibliothek, Ms. Guelf. 287 Extrav. ('Wolfenbüttel Chansonnier').

APPENDIX 2

Helas que pourra devenir

LC, fols. 61v–63r (No. 39)

[Caron]

The musical score is presented in three systems, each with three staves. The top staff is for the Tenor (T) and the bottom staff is for the Contratenor (Ct). The middle staff is for the Contratenor (Ct) and the bottom staff is for the Contratenor (Ct). The music is in a single system with a key signature of one flat (B-flat) and a common time signature (C). The lyrics are written below the staves.

System 1:

- Top staff: Helas,
- Middle staff: Helas, que pourra
- Bottom staff: Helas

System 2:

- Top staff: que pourra devenir Mon cuer, s'il ne peult
- Middle staff: T
- Bottom staff: Ct

System 3:

- Top staff: parvenir A celle haultainne entreprise,
- Middle staff: T
- Bottom staff: Ct (i) (ii)

System 4:

- Top staff: T
- Middle staff: T
- Bottom staff: Ct

16 Residuüm
Ou sa voulenté est submise

T
8
Ou sa voulenté

Ct
8
Ou sa voulenté (iii)

21
Pour mielux sur

T
8

Ct
8
(iv) (v)

25
toutes advenir?

T
8

Ct
8
(vi)

29

T
8

Ct
8

C'est choays sans ailleurs revenir,
 Eslicte pour (tout) temps advenir
 Avoir plaisance a sa divise.
 Helas, *que pourra devenir*
Mon cuer, s'il ne peult parvenir
A celle haultainne entreprise?

Or est contraint pour la venir
 Car desir l'a fait convenir
 Qui l'a mis hors de sa franchise
 Et desja (est) sa cause [est] commise
 Et excercer par souvenir.
 Helas, *que pourra devenir*
Mon cuer, s'il ne peult parvenir
A celle haultainne entreprise,
Ou sa volenté est submise
Pour mieulx sur toutes advenir?

(i) *a* in the LC. This error is unique (as are ii–iv).

(ii) *a* in the LC.

(iii) *d* in the LC.

(iv) *d* in the LC.

(v) Diminished fifth between tenor and contratenor criticised in J. Tinctoris, *The Art of Counterpoint*, p. 130.

(vi) Dissonance between tenor and contratenor also in Lab1, P676, Segovia and Wolf. Other sources have a dotted minim *g* and semiminim *f*.

APPENDIX 3

Aime qui voudra

LC, fols. 18v-19r, No. 14

Anon.

Tenor
 Contratenor

Aime qui voudra
 Le mieux qu'il pourra.

8
 Aime qui voudra

8
 Aime qui voudra

4
 Ce n'est que

T
 8

Ct
 8

8
 soussi,

T
 8

Ct
 8

12
 Car jamays sans sy

T
 8

Ct
 8

(i)
 (ii)

16

Amours ne sera.

T

Ct

20

(iii) (iv)

T

Ct

24

T

Ct

Qui plus aimera
 Plus se trouvera
 Subget a mercy.
 Aime *qui*ouldra
Le mieulx qu'il pourra.
Ce n'est que soussi.

Ou Danger mourra
 Ou tousjours fera,
 Cela ou cecy,
 La chouse est ainsi.
 Amours ainsi va.

Aime quiouldra
 Le mieulx qu'il pourra.
 Ce n'est que soussi.
 Car jamays sans sy
 Amours ne sera.

(i) Breve *g* in the LC, dissonant with the discantus. Dij shares this error. The breve rest of Col and Grog is adopted here.

(ii) Dotted semibreve *f'* and minim *g'* in the LC, dissonant with the tenor. Dij shares this error. The solution of Col and Grog is adopted here.

(iii) Semibreve in the LC, dissonant with the contratenor's *g*. Dij shares this error. Col and Grog transmit a minim.

(iv) Semibreve in the LC, dotted in Col and Dij. Glog transmits an additional minim on the same pitch

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Alden, Jane. 'Formes of Intimacy: Miniaturisation and Sociability in the Fifteenth-Century Chansonnier.' In: *The Media of Secular Music in the Medieval and Early Modern Period (1100–1650)*, eds. Vincenzo Borghetti and Alexandros Maria Hatzikiriakos, 116–138. London: Routledge, 2024.
- Aarburg, Ursula. 'Melodien zum frühen deutschen Minnesang: Eine kritische Bestandsaufnahme.' In: *Der deutsche Minnesang: Aufsätze zu seiner Erforschung*, ed. Hans Fromm, 378–424. Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1963 (= Wege der Forschung 15).
- Alexandri Agricola (1446–1506): Opera omnia*, ed. Edward R. Lerner. 5 vols. S.l.: American Institute of Musicology, 1961–1970 (= Corpus Mensurabilis Musicae 22).
- Alden, Jane. *Songs, Scribes, and Society: The History and Reception of the Loire Valley Chansonniers*. Oxford–New York: Oxford University Press, 2010.

- Ambros, August Wilhelm. *Geschichte der Musik*. 2nd ed. 5 vols. Breslau: Leuckert, 1880–89.
- Banks, Jon. *The Instrumental Consort Repertory of the Late Fifteenth Century*. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2006.
- Benthem, Jaap van. 'Die Saganer Stimmbücher (Das Glogauer Liederbuch): Eine unbeachtete Quelle für Johannes Tourout?' In: *The Musical Culture of Silesia before 1742: New Contexts – New Perspectives*, eds. Paweł Gancarczyk, Lenka Hlávková-Mráčková and Remigiusz Pośpiech, 71–82. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang, 2013.
- Boorman, Stanley. 'Limitations and Extensions of Filiation Technique.' In: *Music in Medieval and Early Modern Europe: Patronage, Sources and Texts*, ed. by Iain Fenlon, 319–346. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981.
- Brown, Howard Mayer. 'Emulation, Competition, and Homage: Imitation and Theories of Imitation in the Renaissance.' *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 35, no. 1 (1982): 1–48. doi.org/10.2307/831286.
- Brown, Howard Mayer. 'A "New" Chansonnier of the Early Sixteenth Century in the University Library of Uppsala: A Preliminary Report.' *Musica Disciplina* 37 (1983): 171–233.
- Burn, David J. 'Central and Peripheral Musical Traditions in the Low Countries in the Earlier Sixteenth Century.' *Journal of the Alamire Foundation* 15, no. 2 (2023): 193–199. doi.org/10.1484/J.JAF.5.135280.
- Burn, David J. 'The Leuven Chansonnier: A New Source for Mid Fifteenth-Century Franco-Flemish Polyphonic Song.' *Journal of the Alamire Foundation* 9, no. 1 (2017): 135–158. doi.org/10.1484/J.JAF.5.114052.
- Burn, David J. *Leuven Chansonnier: Study*. Antwerp: Davidsfonds, 2017 (= Leuven Library of Music in Facsimile 1).
- Busnoys, Antoine. *Collected Works. Works with Texts in the Vernacular*, ed. Leeman L. Perkins. 2 vols. New York: The Broude Trust, 2018 (= Masters and Monuments of the Renaissance 5).
- Chansonnier de Jean de Montchenu (Bibliothèque nationale, Rothschild 2973 [I.5.13])*, eds. David Fallows and Geneviève Thibault. Paris: Société française de musicologie, 1991.
- The Cappella Giulia Chansonnier (Rome, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, C.G.XIII.27)*, ed. Allan W. Atlas. 2 vols. Brooklyn, NY: Institute of Mediaeval Music, 1975–76.
- The Copenhagen Chansonnier and the 'Loire Valley' Chansonniers: An Open Access Project*, ed. Peter Woetmann Christoffersen. 2013–25. https://chansonniers.pwch.dk, accessed 7 July 2025.
- Cumming, Julie. 'From Variety to Repetition: The Birth of Imitative Polyphony.' *Yearbook of the Alamire Foundation* 6 (2008): 21–44.
- Defaux, Gérard, and Thierry Mantovani. *Jehan Marot: Les deux recueils*. Geneva: Droz, 1999.
- Earp, Lawrence. 'Texting in 15th-Century French Chansons: A Look Ahead from the 14th Century.' *Early Music* 19, no. 2 (1991): 194–210. doi.org/10.1093/earlyj/XIX.2.195.
- Les faictz et dictz de Jean Molinet*, ed. Noël Dupire. 3 vols. Paris: Société des anciens textes français, 1936–39.
- Falck, Robert. 'Parody and Contrafactum: A Terminological Clarification.' *The Musical Quarterly* 65, no. 1 (1979): 1–21. doi.org/10.1093/mq/LXV.1.1.
- Fallows, David. *Art Songs of the Burgundian Era, 1415–1480*. Oxford–New York: Oxford University Press, forthcoming.
- Fallows, David. *A Catalogue of Polyphonic Songs, 1415–1480*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999.
- Fallows, David. 'French as a Courtly Language in Fifteenth-Century Italy: The Musical Evidence.' *Renaissance Studies* 3, no. 4 (1989): 429–441.

- Fallows, David. *Josquin*. Turnhout: Brepols, 2009.
- Fallows, David. 'The Most Popular Songs of the Fifteenth Century.' In: *The Cambridge History of Fifteenth-Century Music*, eds. Anna Maria Busse Berger and Jesse Rodin, 787–801. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015.
- Fallows, David. 'Texting in the Chansonnier of Jean de Montchenu.' In: *Songs and Musicians in the Fifteenth Century*, ed. David Fallows, 1–13. Aldershot: Routledge, 1996.
- Fallows, David Nicholas. 'Robert Morton's Songs: A Study of Styles in the Mid-Fifteenth Century.' PhD diss., University of California, Berkeley, 1978.
- Fétis, François-Joseph. *Biographie universelle des musiciens et bibliographie générale de la musique*. 2nd ed. 8 vols. Paris: Firmin-Didot, 1860–65.
- Florence, BNC, *Panciaticchi 27: Text and Context*, ed. Gioia Filocamo, transl. by Bonnie J. Blackburn. Turnhout: Brepols, 2010 (= Monumenta Musica Europea, Section II, Renaissance 1).
- A Florentine Chansonnier from the Time of Lorenzo the Magnificent: Florence, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale MS Banco Rari 229*, ed. Howard Mayer Brown. Chicago–London: University of Chicago Press, 1983.
- Gallagher, Sean. 'Caron and Florence: A New Ascription and the Copying of the Pixérécourt Chansonnier.' In: 'Recevez ce mien petit labeur.' *Studies in Renaissance Music in Honour of Ignace Bossuyt*, eds. Mark Delaere and Pieter Bergé, 83–92. Leuven: Leuven University Press, 2008.
- Gallagher, Sean. 'Cent mille escus, the *Ma maistresse* Complex, and the Leuven Chansonnier.' *Journal of the Alamire Foundation* 17, no. 1 (2025), forthcoming.
- Gancarczyk, Paweł. 'Abbot Martin Rinkenbergh and the Origins of the "Glogauer Liederbuch."' *Early Music* 37, no. 1 (2009): 27–36. doi.org/10.1093/em/can158.
- Gancarczyk, Paweł. 'The Former "Glogauer Liederbuch" and Early Partbooks: On the Origin and Function of a New Type of Musical Codex.' *Tijdschrift van de Koninklijke Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis* 64, no. 1 (2014): 30–46.
- Gancarczyk, Paweł. 'Johannes Tourout and the Imperial *Hofkantorei* ca. 1460.' *Hudební věda* 50, nos. 3–4 (2013): 239–257.
- Gancarczyk, Paweł. *Musica scripto: Kodeksy menzuralne II połowy XV wieku na wschodzie Europy Łacińskiej* [*Musica scripto. Mensural Codices in Eastern Latin Europe in the Second Half of the Fifteenth Century*]. Warsaw: Instytut Sztuki Polskiej Akademii Nauk, 2001.
- Gancarczyk, Paweł. 'Neapolitan Repertory in the Glogauer Liederbuch.' *Musicology Today* 1 (2004): 38–48.
- Gennrich, Friedrich. *Die Kontrafaktur im Liedschaffen des Mittelalters*. Langen bei Frankfurt: s.n., 1965.
- Gennrich, Friedrich. 'Die Musik als Hilfswissenschaft der romanischen Philologie.' *Zeitschrift für romanische Philologie* 39 (1919): 330–361.
- Gennrich, Friedrich. *Musikwissenschaft und romanische Philologie: Ein Beitrag zur Bewertung der Musik als Hilfswissenschaft der romanischen Philologie*. Halle an der Saale: Max Niemeyer, 1918.
- Das Glogauer Liederbuch*, ed. Christian Väterlein. Vol. 4. Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1981 (= Das Erbe deutscher Musik 86).
- Goldberg, Clemens. 'Reading Laborde: The Significance of Johannes Ockeghem's Chansons in the Context of the Chansonnier Laborde.' In: *Johannes Ockeghem: Actes du XLe Colloque international d'études humanistes, Tours 3–8 février 1997*, ed. Philippe Vendrix, 253–270. Paris: Klincksieck, 1998.

- Goldberg, Clemens. *Das Chansonnier Laborde: Studien zur Intertextualität einer Liederhandschrift des 15. Jahrhunderts*. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang, 1997 (= Quellen und Studien zur Musikgeschichte von der Antike bis in die Gegenwart 36).
- Le grand et vrai art de pleine rhétorique de Pierre Fabri*, ed. Alexandre Héron. 2 vols. Rouen: Espérance Cagniard, 1889–90.
- Grassl, Markus. 'Kontrafaktur – Borrowing – Intertextualität: Stationen der musikwissenschaftlichen Auseinandersetzung.' In: *Kontrafakturen im Kontext*, ed. Agnese Pavanello, 25–51. Basel: Schwabe, 2020.
- Gutiérrez-Denhoff, Martella. *Der Wolfenbütteler Chansonnier: Wolfenbüttel, Herzog August Bibliothek Codex Guelf. 287 Extrav. Untersuchungen zu Repertoire und Überlieferung einer Musikhandschrift des 15. Jahrhunderts und ihres Umkreises*. Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz, 1985 (= Wolfenbütteler Forschungen 29).
- Kennedy, Duff James. 'Six chansonniers français: The Central Sources of the Franco-Burgundian Chanson.' PhD diss., University of California, Santa Barbara, 1987.
- Kenney, Sylvia. 'Contrafacta in the Works of Walter Frye.' *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 8, no. 3 (1955): 182–202. doi.org/10.2307/829688.
- Kenney, Sylvia. *Walter Frye and the 'contenance angloise'*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1964.
- Meconi, Honey. 'Is Underlay Necessary?' In: *Companion to Medieval and Renaissance Music*, eds. Tess Knighton and David Fallows, 284–91. New York: Schirmer Books, 1992.
- Music from the Pixérécourt Manuscript: A Modern Edition of Twelve Compositions from Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, Ms. fonds français 15123*, ed. Edward Pease. Ann Arbor: University Microfilms, 1960.
- Ockeghem, Johannes. *Collected Works*. Vol. 3, *Motets and Chansons*, eds. Richard Wexler and Dragan Plamenac. Boston: Schirmer, 1992 (= American Musicological Society, Studies and Documents 7).
- O'Sullivan, Ryan. 'Musical Transmission Networks and the Leuven Chansonnier.' *Journal of the Alamire Foundation* 17, no. 1 (2025), forthcoming.
- O'Sullivan, Ryan. 'The Leuven Chansonnier: Provenance, Transmission, and Authorships.' PhD diss., KU Leuven, 2024.
- O'Sullivan, Ryan. 'The Leuven Chansonnier's Early Provenance.' *Journal of the Alamire Foundation* 16, no. 2 (2024): 281–311. doi.org/10.1484/J.JAF.5.142078.
- Pease, Edward Joseph. 'An Edition of the Pixérécourt Manuscript: Paris, Bibliothèque nationale, fonds fr. 15123.' PhD diss., Indiana University, 1959.
- Plamenac, Dragan. 'A Reconstruction of the French Chansonnier in the Biblioteca Colombina, Seville – I.' *The Musical Quarterly* 37, no. 4 (1951): 501–542. doi.org/10.1093/mq/XXXVII.4.501.
- Recueil d'arts de seconde rhétorique*, ed. Ernest Langlois, Paris: Imprimerie nationale, 1902.
- Reynolds, Christopher A. 'The Counterpoint of Allusion in Fifteenth-Century Masses.' *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 45, no. 2 (1992): 228–260. doi.org/10.2307/831448.
- Robertet, Jean. *Œuvres*, ed. Margaret Zsuppán. Geneva: Droz, 1970.
- Rifkin, Joshua. 'Munich, Milan, and a Marian Motet: Dating Josquin's *Ave Maria ... virgo serena*.' *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 56, no. 2 (2003): 239–350. doi.org/10.1525/jams.2003.56.2.239.
- Rifkin, Joshua. 'Busnoys and Italy: The Evidence of Two Songs.' In: *Antoine Busnoys: Method, Meaning, and Context in Late Medieval Music*, ed. Paula Higgins, 505–571. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1999.

- Scriptorum de musica medii aevi*, ed. Edmond de Coussemaker. 4 vols. Paris: A. Durand et Pedone-Lauriel, 1864–76.
- Saunders, Suparmi Elizabeth. 'The Dating of the Trent Codices from their Watermarks: With a Study of the Local Liturgy of Trent in the Fifteenth Century.' PhD Diss., University of London, 1983.
- Secular Polyphony 1380–1480*, ed. David Fallows. London: Stainer and Bell, 2014 (= *Musica Britannica* 97).
- Strohm, Reinhard. 'Instrumentale Ensemblesmusik vor 1500: Das Zeugnis der mitteleuropäischen Quellen.' In: *Musik und Tanz zur Zeit Kaiser Maximilian I. Bericht über die am 21. und 22. Oktober 1989 in Innsbruck abgehaltene Fachtagung*, ed. Walter Salmen, 89–106. Innsbruck: Helbling, 1992.
- Strohm, Reinhard. *The Rise of European Music, 1380–1500*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993.
- Thomson, James C. 'The Works of Caron: A Study in Fifteenth-Century Style.' 2 vols. PhD diss., New York University, 1959.
- Tintoris, Johannes. *The Art of Counterpoint (Liber de arte contrapuncti)*, transl. by Albert Seay. s.l.: American Institute of Musicology, 1961 (= *Musicological Studies and Documents* 5).
- Tintoris, Johannes. *Proportionale musices; Liber de arte contrapuncti*, ed. Gianluca D'Agostino, Florence: Edizioni del Galluzzo per la Fondazione Ezio Franceschini, 2008.
- Toffetti, Marina. 'Contrafacere. Rertextualizing Polyphonic Music from the Late Sixteenth to the Seventeenth Century.' In: *Contrafacta: Modes of Music Re-textualization in the Late Sixteenth and Seventeenth Century*, eds. Marina Toffetti and Gabriele Taschetti, 9–39. Kraków: Musica Iagellonica, 2020.
- Wegman, Rob C. 'Fremin le Caron at Amiens: New Documents.' In: *Essays on Renaissance Music in Honour of David Fallows: 'Bon jour, bon mois et bonne estrenne'*, eds. Fabrice Fitch and Jacobijn Kiel, 10–32. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2011.
- Wesner, Amanda Zuckerman. 'The Chansons of Loyset Compère: Authenticity and Stylistic Development.' PhD diss., Harvard University, 1992.
- Wexler, Richard. 'The Complete Works of Johannes Prioris.' PhD diss., New York University, 1974.
- Der Wolfenbütteler Chansonnier: Herzog August Bibliothek Codex Guelf. 287 Extrav*, ed. Martella Gutiérrez-Denhoff. Mainz: Schott, 1988 (= *Musikalische Denkmäler* 10).
- Wolff, Arthur S. 'The Chansonnier Biblioteca Casanatense 2856: Its History, Purpose, and Music.' 2 vols. PhD diss., North Texas State University, Denton, 1970.
- Wright, Peter. 'Johannes Wiser's Paper and the Copying of his Manuscripts.' In: *I codici musicali trentini: Nuove scoperte e nuovi orientamenti della ricerca*, ed. Peter Wright, 31–53. Trento: Provincia autonoma di Trento, 1996.

WERNAKULARNE KONTRAFAKTURY W LEUVEN CHANSONNIER?

HELAS CARONA I ANONIMOWE AIME QUI VOULDR A

Badania nad chanson często cechuje nieufność wobec piętnastowiecznych włoskich lub środkowoeuropejskich źródeł przekazujących kontrafaktury. Rękopisy pochodzące z Francji lub Niderlandów cieszą się natomiast wśród badaczy większym prestiżem, częściowo dlatego, że zawarte w nich teksty uchodzą za autentyczne. Próby przeciwdziałania tej dysproporcji polegają zwykle na dowartościowywaniu warstwy muzycznej źródeł peryferyjnych, analizie datowalnych filigranów lub wskazywaniu na obecność chansons, które nie zachowały się w źródłach centralnych. David J. Burn zaproponował inne podejście do opozycji centrum–peryferia, mianowicie, by analizę krytyczną, z reguły ograniczoną do źródeł peryferyjnych, zastosować również do tych uznawanych za centralne. Mój artykuł, utrzymany w tym właśnie duchu, bada potencjalne wernakularne kontrafaktury w niedawno odkrytym źródle centralnym, Leuven Chansonnier, datowanym na lata ok. 1470–75.

Rękopis ten przekazuje czterdzieści dziewięć francuskich pieśni, których teksty mogą na pierwszy rzut oka sprawiać wrażenie autentycznych. Argumentuję jednak, że dwie z nich to najprawdopodobniej kontrafaktury: *Helas que pourra devenir* Firminusa Carona oraz anonimowa *Aime qui voudra*. Na podstawie między innymi dotąd pomijanego podobieństwa strukturalnego między *Aime qui voudra* a *Helas* Carona sugeruję, że muzyka anonimowego utworu została skomponowana do nieznanego czterowersowego rondeau.

Przekonanie o oryginalności znakomitej większości zachowanych tekstów chansons wzmacnia rzadkość zachowanych alternatywnych wersji tekstów francuskich. Niemniej jednak, wernakularne kontrafaktury mogą być bardziej rozpowszechnione niż sugeruje to obraz źródeł, zwłaszcza że około jednej trzeciej chansons występujących w źródłach centralnych to unika, a dziesiątki innych mają odpowiedniki jedynie w obrębie tej powiązanej grupy rękopisów. Moje ustalenia sugerują, że również inne centralne zbiory chansons powinny zostać poddane podobnej analizie jak Leuven Chansonnier. Wykorzystanie metod zwykle zarezerwowanych dla źródeł peryferyjnych w analizie materiałów uznawanych za centralne może umożliwić bardziej zrównoważone spojrzenie na tradycję piętnastowiecznych pieśni.

Przekł. Bartłomiej Gembicki

Ryan O'Sullivan studied musicology in York, Utrecht and Mainz before beginning his doctoral studies in Leuven. He defended his dissertation on the Leuven Chansonnier in May 2024. Currently he is an independent scholar.
