

ITALIAN MUSIC IN CENTRAL-EASTERN EUROPE. AROUND MIKOŁAJ ZIELEŃSKI'S OFFERTORIA AND COMMUNIONES (1611), EDS. TOMASZ JEŻ, BARBARA PRZYBYSZEWSKA-JARMIŃSKA AND MARINA TOFFETTI

Venezia 2015 Edizioni Fondazione Levi (= TRA.DI.MUS. Studi e Monografie 2), pp. XXIII+464. ISBN 978-88-7552-057-1

In 2015, the Fondazione Levi of Venice published the collection of essays *Italian music in Central-Eastern Europe. Around Mi-kołaj Zieleński's Offertoria and Communiones (1611)*, edited by Tomasz Jeż, Barbara Przybyszewska-Jarmińska and Marina Toffetti. The volume includes almost all the papers delivered at the conference *Central-Eastern Europe versus the Italian musica moderna: Reception, adaptation, integration*, held in Warsaw in 2011 and organised within the context of the research project TRA.D.I.MUS. (Tracking the Dissemination of Italian Music in Europe, 16th-17th Centuries). The volume discussed here is the second publi-

cation in the series TRA.D.I.MUS. Studi e monografie.¹

As the title makes clear, this publication revolves around one of the monuments of the reception of Italian style in the Polish-Lithuanian Commonwealth, namely

¹ The first volume in the series, published in 2012, was previously reviewed in this journal. See Bartłomiej Gembicki, 'La musica policorale in Italia e nell'Europa centro-orientale fra Cinque e Seicento / Polychoral Music in Italy and in Central-Eastern Europe at the Turn of the Seventeenth Century, a cura di Aleksandra Patalas, Marina Toffetti, Edizioni Fondazione Levi, Venezia 2012' [review], *Muzyka* 60 (2015) no. 2, pp. 127–134.

Mikołaj Zieleński's *Offertoria* and *Communiones*, published in Venice by Giacomo Vincenti in 1611. It is safe to say that not all the contributions deal directly with Zieleński and his output. That is not in itself detrimental to the book, but the title does seem somewhat misleading, even if its Zieleński-centrism is mitigated by the preposition 'around'.

The editors decided to organise the volume in two parts: one more strictly related to Zieleński (pp. 1–204), the other focussing more broadly on the reception of Italian music in Central and Eastern Europe (pp. 205–443).

One of the positive aspects of the conference was the participation of scholars from other disciplines, since an interdisciplinary approach is fundamental to addressing cultural practices related to *italianità*. In this respect, music is obviously just one facet of the wider reception of Italian art and culture.

This volume opens with an historical overview by Wojciech Tygielski ("Le Indie d'Europa". La Repubblica polacco-lituana, un mosaico di nazioni e religioni', pp. 3–11). The author outlines some basic features of the Polish-Lithuanian Commonwealth, such as multilingualism and multiculturalism, and the presence of different religious groups. Although the article contains much interesting information, Tygielski is not very generous with bibliographic references, so the reader wonders about the sources of the cited information (see, for instance, p. 5). Generally speaking, what emerges is an idyllic image of sixteenth- and early seventeenth-century Poland, which seems rather suspicious to non-specialist readers like myself: there is no doubt that more bibliographic information would have helped guide the reader and support the thesis proposed in the article.

The other two non-musicological contributions, by Marcin Fabiański and Grażyna Jurkowlaniec, address architecture and

figurative arts. Fabiański ('Cenni sul concetto di arte, ossia sul disegno, nella letteratura polacca del Cinquecento', pp. 73–86) highlights how the perception of *italianità* in architecture and art was strongly influenced by the ideas of the Renaissance and classicism, aspects not so present in the reception of Italian music. Jurkowlaniec ('La porpora cardinalizia e l'arte nera nell'incisione: Tomasz Treter tra gerarchie ecclesiastiche e stampatori romani e veneziani', pp. 87–107) deals with an interesting case of Italian-Polish collaboration in the realisation of three engravings dedicated to the cardinal and prince-bishop of Warmia Stanislaus Hosius.

The patronage of bishops is addressed also in the first strictly musicological contribution in the volume, by Barbara Przybyszewska-Jarmińska ('Music in Poland under the patronage of bishops at the turn of the seventeenth century', pp. 13–29). Aiming to give a more detailed picture of the musical patronage of Polish bishops around 1600, Przybyszewska-Jarmińska succeeds in linking pieces of information from different kinds of sources (archive sources, diaries, letters, dedications, historical inventories, etc.), thus broadening the perspective beyond the patronage linked directly to the royal court. Among other interesting figures, she reassesses the musical interests of András Báthory, cardinal and prince-bishop of Warmia, best known to musicologists as the dedicatee of Giovanni Pierluigi da Palestrina's fifth book of contribution motets (pp. 14–19).

Marco Bizzarini's contribution ('Zieleński e il ruolo delle relazioni italo-polacche nel mecenatismo musicale tra Cinquecento e Seicento', pp. 31–42) zooms in on a figure already addressed in the preceding essay, namely Wojciech Baranowski, the dedicatee of Zieleński's *Offertoria* and *Communiones*. Besides discussing the paratexts of Zieleński's publication, Bizzarini investigates the relationship between Baranowski and another great patron of music, Federigo Borromeo,

archbishop of Milan. Bizzarrini displays a detailed understanding of Baranowski's interest in Italian music, thus illuminating the context behind Zieleński's publication.

The ample paratexts of Zieleński's publication are further discussed in the following essay, by Agnieszka Leszczyńska, who shows the complexity of the interrelations between the content, the table of contents and the liturgical calendar included in the print, revealing how Zieleński consciously played with the liturgical conventions of his homeland and more common ritual practices (see 'The liturgical context of the *Offertoria* and *Communiones* by Mikołaj Zieleński', pp. 43–64).

Elżbieta Zwolińska's brief essay 'Zieleński e la ricezione dell'italianità nella cultura musicale polacca' (pp. 65–72) adds an important point to the history of the reception of Italian music in Polish musical culture, stressing that it was not confined to the late sixteenth century (pp. 66–67). She also rightly recalls that around 1600 Italian music was not always welcome, as it is evidenced by the sermons of Piotr Skarga, preacher to King Sigismund III Vasa (p. 68).

The essays by Hanna Osiecka-Samsonowicz and Mirosław Lenart focus on other aspects that deepen our understanding of Polish-Italian musical relations, thus illuminating Polish patrons' fascination with Italian music. Osiecka-Samsonowicz addresses the *apparati* in the Roman church of Santo Stanislao dei Polacchi, the church of the Polish Nation in Rome ('Feste e musiche nella chiesa di Santo Stanislao dei Polacchi a Roma nella prima metà del Seicento', pp. 109–120). Celebrations organised by the Polish Nation often involved elaborate musical performances, and they might have formed a context in which Polish pilgrims and travellers could encounter Italian music.

Lenart's contribution is devoted to the Veneto ('Presenze musicali polacche in Veneto: ambiente, pratiche, personalità', pp. 121–130). He sums up information of

different kinds, such as visits by Polish sovereigns, the presence of Polish citizens in Italian centres and the activity of Polish musicians at the Basilica del Santo in Padua. His contribution is slightly unfocused, as it deals with very different kinds of 'cultural encounters', but the author succeeds in stressing that 'musical migration' between Italy and Poland was bidirectional.

Rodolfo Baroncini's essay 'La vita musicale a Venezia tra Cinquecento e Seicento: musici, committenti e repertori' (pp. 131–150), although only loosely connected with Zieleński, is probably the most groundbreaking contribution in the whole volume. Thanks to painstaking archive research, Baroncini is able to show the impressive presence of music-related professionals in Venice: 121 singers, 545 instrumentalists, 139 constructors of musical instruments and 11 dancers (p. 133). I am not aware of any other such detailed analysis of the musical forces active in an early modern city. Baroncini draws a complex picture of musical patronage, involving not just state and other collective institutions, but also private noblemen and citizens. The very useful tables on pp. 147–150 give a vivid image of the personalities who animated the Venetian *ridotti* – noblemen, citizens, intellectuals, painters and musicians – and of a Venetian 'intellectual scene' that was much more interconnected and 'multidisciplinary' than is usually suggested by modern studies. Baroncini also traces the relations between patronage and style, highlighting the role of the *ridotti* in the diffusion of 'small-scale' musical genres (p. 141). He reveals a wealth of unknown sources and documents, including a new document regarding Claudio Monteverdi (p. 142).

With Luigi Collarile's contribution 'Zieleński e il contesto editoriale veneziano nel primo Seicento: questioni e prospettive' (pp. 151–170), we remain in Venice. Collarile interprets Zieleński's *Offertoria* and *Communiones* within the context of Venetian music

printing. He argues that Zieleński's editorial project was indeed out of the ordinary and must be understood as part of the cultural policy of its dedicatee. It is unlikely that the publisher, Vincenti, expected any profit from the project, and Zieleński and his patron, Baranowski, may have chosen him in order to benefit from his prestige as a leading Italian music publisher (pp. 161–162).

The following essay by Aneta Markuszevska is devoted to Lucia Quinciani's lamento *Udite lagrimosi spirti d'Averno*, printed in Venice in 1611 as part of Marc'Antonio Negri's *Affetti amorosi* (see 'The Lamento *Udite lagrimosi spirti d'Averno* by Lucia Quinciani in Marc'Antonio Negri's *Affetti amorosi* (Venice, 1611)', pp. 171–181). *Udite lagrimosi spirti* is the first example of secular monody published by a female composer, and the only known composition by Quinciani. Markuszevska reads the lamento from the perspective of gender studies, but unfortunately the results are not always convincing. The focus of the article is the alleged 'paradox' of a female composer (Quinciani) setting a lamento from Battista Guarini's *Pastor fido*, which, in the original pastoral tragicomedy, is spoken by a young man (Mirtillo). For Markuszevska's argument, it is fundamental to assess who chose the text. Here there seem to be some contradictions: on p. 175, the author proposes that the text was chosen by Marc'Antonio Negri (Quinciani's teacher); on p. 179, however, she reads the choice of text as being part of a genderised cultural agenda pursued by Quinciani, who, 'by composing a young man's lamento [...] was demonstrating her musical mastery and dispelling the myth of female nature as unbridled and uncontrollable'. In the abstract, it is proposed that Quinciani, not Negri, chose the text (p. 180). Additionally, it is not clear why the author identifies the poetic 'I' of the lamento (the young man Mirtillo) with the composer. There are also further contradictions: on p. 180 Markusze-

vska refers to Quinciani's 'musical mastery', whilst on p. 173 she seems to consider the possibility that she never composed any other piece. It seems very unrealistic that *Udite lagrimosi spirti d'Averno* is Quinciani's first and last composition, since it shows a sound knowledge of the monodic style. In the conclusion, Markuszevska seems to suggest that Quinciani's lamento could be a 'swan song [...] followed by a life-long science' (p. 180). This idea fails to recognise the function of music printing, which cannot be considered an exact mirror of musical life. Without denying the difficulties that a woman composer must have encountered in a patriarchal society, the fact that she did not publish anything else does not guarantee that she stopped composing and/or performing.

The last contribution of part one, from the pen of Chiara Comparin, is devoted to Antonio Gualtieri (*I Motecta octonis vocibus* (Venezia, 1604) di Antonio Gualtieri sullo sfondo della produzione polichorale tra Padova e Venezia', pp. 183–204). Comparin reconstructs the fascinating biography of this little-known composer, active in Friuli and Veneto, and proposes an analysis of his collection of polychoral motets *Motecta octonis vocibus* (Venice 1608). Since Gualtieri was active both in Padua and in Venice, Comparin tries to differentiate between the polychoral traditions of those two important musical centres. Although useful as a working hypothesis, such a binary contrast is most likely a modern musicological construct: countless composers were active in both cities, and it is probably impossible to establish a clear-cut differentiation of stylistic trends.

Part two opens with Marina Toffetti's analysis of intertextual phenomena in the motets of Giulio Cesare Gabussi, a key figure for Italian-Polish musical relations ('Gabussi's legacy: Intertextual phenomena involving the *Motectorum liber primus* (Venice, 1586)', pp. 207–234). Toffetti seeks to reconstruct his compositional

background, analysing the *Motectorum liber primus* (Venice 1586), arguing that an intertextual analysis is apt to uncover Gabussi's musical milieu. Toffetti is rightly very cautious and never jumps to conclusions, aware that not all similarities can be read as deliberate and conscious imitation. Nevertheless, she is able to show some fascinating compositional similarities. Most interestingly, she demonstrates how one setting can interact with different hypotexts without involving exactly the same verbal text (see the analysis of motets by Palestrina, Marenzio, Gabussi and Osculati at pp. 220–227). This should be taken into account in all analyses of intertextuality in the motet repertoire, which traditionally tend to focus just on parallel settings of the same text. Toffetti's interpretation of Gabussi's interest in canons by inversion as an 'intellectual approach to composition' (p. 212) and 'complexity' (p. 215) is not entirely convincing, but the essay remains a compelling illustration of the importance of analysis in the reconstruction of a musical culture.

Aleksandra Patalas's contribution is devoted to another fundamental figure for Polish music history, namely, Asprilio Pacelli, who led the chapel of the Polish royal court from 1602 till his death, in 1623 (see 'Asprilio Pacelli in Poland: Compositions, techniques, reception', pp. 235–260). Patalas conducts bibliographic research into sources of Pacelli's music (see the tables at pp. 238–244), carefully differentiating between settings composed in Italy and those probably composed in the Polish-Lithuanian Commonwealth. She convincingly relates some compositions of Pacelli's Polish period to specific contexts, such as the *capella rorantistarum* at Cracow cathedral (p. 245).

Piotr Wilk's contribution probably would have been better suited to part one, as it addresses the instrumental *Fantasia* published by Zieleński in his *Communiones* ('The *Fantasia* of Mikołaj Zieleński and the early Baroque

tradition of diminution and ensemble instrumental music', pp. 261–278). Wilk shows convincingly that the *Fantasia* are well differentiated from the vocal style, thus overturning the traditional musicological discourse about these compositions. Additionally, he draws attention to the possible performance context suggested by the print, that is, the Holy Communion, stressing its role in defining the instrumental style (pp. 269–270).

Anna Ryszka-Komarnicka's essay 'Between literary tradition and patriotic war: The Warsaw *Giuditta* [?] (1635)' (pp. 279–293) is particularly welcome, as it stands alone in the volume in addressing one important aspect of musical *italianità*: the *dramma per musica*. The author deals with an interesting source: a printed summary of *Giuditta* (1635), the first *dramma per musica* shown in Warsaw. Ryszka-Komarnicka outlines the tradition of libretti based on Judith's tale and reveals the political messages that were conveyed by the Warsaw performance of *Giuditta* (p. 289).

The following six essays deal with the reception of Italian stylistic devices in various European regions, such as Austrian lands, Venetian Istria, Dalmatia, Hungary and the Czech lands. These contributions highlight how techniques such as polychorality and *monodia accompagnata* were not simply practised by musicians of Italian origin, but were soon mastered also by local composers. One case in point is the composer Isaac Posch, discussed in Metoda Kokole's essay ('Early sacred monody and its journey from the eastern shores of the Adriatic to the Austrian Lands north of the Alps', pp. 295–323). Posch composed *Harmonia concertans* (Nuremberg 1623), a collection of concertato motets whose paratexts explicitly refer to Italy and to Lodovico Viadana (p. 307). In the appendix, Kokole includes five complete transcriptions of settings by composers discussed in her essay, so that the reader can appreciate their style.

Ennio Stipčević offers a short overview of Tomaso Cecchini, a Veronese composer active in Split and Hvar (*'Musica moderna and local tradition: The case of Tomaso Cecchini Veronese in Dalmatia'*, pp. 325–347). For the most part, the contribution consists of a list of Cecchini's works in extant and lost printed sources (pp. 333–347).

Jana Kalinayová-Bartová (*'Italian music in the repertoire of Bratislavian musical institutions in the seventeenth century'*, pp. 349–364) focusses on two institutions that played a fundamental role in shaping the musical life of seventeenth-century Bratislava: the Catholic church of St Martin and the Lutheran church of the Holy Trinity. Among many interesting aspects, she discusses the interaction between different actors in funding musical performances at St Martin's (p. 353), the repertoire recorded in St Martin's musical inventories of 1616 and 1700 (pp. 354–355), and the activity of town trumpeters in both Catholic and Lutheran institutions (p. 356). Concerning the Lutheran church of the Holy Trinity, she addresses three inventories, dated 1651, 1652 and 1657, which attest to the interest in Italian music, even of Roman origin, apparently quite unusual in Slovakia (p. 360). However, one important issue is not discussed, namely, the function of such a large collection of Italian music in a Lutheran institution. For example, we learn from the 1657 inventory that the cantor Samuel Capricornus acquired collections that contained Masses for the dead by Mario Capuana.² The performance of a Catholic Requiem is a very unlikely event in a Lutheran church. It seems safe to assume, therefore, that Capricornus was buying prints also for the sake of collecting

and/or studying, and not necessarily for performance.

With Janka Petőczová's contribution, we remain in the Kingdom of Hungary (*'Cori spezzati in seventeenth-century Spiš'*, pp. 365–384). The author discusses sources that attest to the cultivation of polychoral music in Spiš, including the output of local composers such as Johann Schimrack and Thomas Gosler. Jan Baťa, meanwhile, deals with polychorality in the Czech lands, lamenting the poor state of research into this issue, caused by a lack of knowledge about primary sources (*'The influence of cori spezzati technique on the music of the Czech lands: The case of Pavel Spongopaeus Jistebnický (ca. 1560–1619)'*, pp. 385–395). He then deals with one case study, Pavel Spongopaeus Jistebnický, including also a list of his works (pp. 391–395). Particularly interesting are the models of Spongopaeus' parody Masses, encompassing composers of four generations (p. 388). Additionally, Baťa is able to convincingly link specific models to contexts with which Spongopaeus came into contact: for example, one Mass is based on the motet *Sic Deus dilexit mundum* by Franziscus de Rivulo, which was in the repertoire of the literati brotherhood in Přeštice, the same town where Spongopaeus was a school teacher (p. 389).

Jiří Sehnal's contribution is devoted to the fascinating figure of Adam Michna, an accomplished poet and composer active in South Bohemia (*'Adam Michna, a Czech composer at the crossroad of styles'*, pp. 397–411). Sehnal offers a brief summary of many interesting compositional features of Michna's output. However, the theoretical background is not entirely convincing. The article is built upon the contrast between 'old' and 'new' style, without a clear and cogent definition of those categories. On p. 397, the label 'old style' seems to refer to the 'archaic' sacred repertoire we find in Bohemian sources; on p. 399, meanwhile, the same label indicates the output of composers such as Lasso, Kerle, Handl and

² Most likely, the *Missa octo vocibus duobus alternantibus choris* (RISM A/I C 950, Venice 1645) and the *Messa di defonti e compieta a quattro voci* (RISM A/I C 953, Venice 1650). See photographs of the inventory on pp. 362–363.

Regnart. On p. 401, 'old style' is used to discuss church songs characterised by 'modal thinking', 'structural step *una nota super la*', 'minor third before the cadence', 'changes of meter' and 'cadence-hemiolas'.

Matthias Schneider's essay stands apart from the other contributions, as it focusses on monodic organ chorales by pupils of the Amsterdam-based organist Jan Pieterszoon Sweelinck ('Monodic organ chorales in the oeuvre of Jan Pieterszoon Sweelinck's pupils', pp. 413–426). Schneider discusses the influence of Italian 'monodic style' on the elaboration of chorale melodies, also pointing to the possible role of Polish musical centres such as Gdańsk and Warsaw in its dissemination.

Zofia Dobrzańska-Fabiańska's contribution is devoted to Zdzisław Jachimecki's monograph *Wpływy włoskie w muzyce polskiej* [Italian influence in Polish music] (Cracow 1911), a fitting topic, since the 2011 conference marked the centenary of the publication of that milestone of Polish musicology ('Zdzisław Jachimecki's *Italian Influences in Polish Music*: an invitation to study the sixteenth- and seventeenth-century reception of Italian musical culture in Poland', pp. 427–443). Dobrzańska-Fabiańska highlights the 'thematic plots' constructed by Jachimecki in analysing Italian influences in Polish music and offers a useful up-to-date survey of the secondary literature on the same issues. Within this context, the reader would definitely have appreciated a deeper insight into the political and ideological agenda behind Jachimecki's intellectual endeavour.

The preceding lines have shown the wealth of topics addressed in the volume under consideration. From a practical point of view, it is also highly commendable that the book is entirely available online on the Fondazione Levi website.³ It is perhaps a bit of a shame that the book was not exactly beautifully produced. For instance, the title

³ <https://www.fondazionelevi.it/editoria/italian-music> (accessed 9 August 2017).

page on the jacket is illegible, being written in white letters on a pink and white background, while spaces are missing between words in the title of the essay on p. 427 (the mistake has been corrected in the online version). Abstracts were sometimes hastily prepared: for instance, the abstract on p. 426 is simply a copy-paste of p. 425. The Italian translation of the abstract of Ryszka-Komarnicka's essay, meanwhile, contains substantial mistakes. It refers to 'l'assedio e la conquista di Smoleńsk da parte delle truppe alla guida dello stesso sovrano' (p. 291): obviously, it is the king who led the army (and not the other way round, as suggested by this sentence), and the Polish troops did not besiege and conquer Smoleńsk, but they broke the siege of the city by Russian troops.

Concerning the overall content of the publication, the volume suffers from being a collective work that assembles essays with different scope and breadth, but this is a problem common to many conference proceedings put together without a rigorous selection process.

It is also regrettable that technical musical terms are often used in a very loose manner. One good example is the term *concertato*, which occurs around sixty times in the volume, often with no specification of what exactly is meant by it. Similarly, many authors resort to the term *cori spezzati*, another problematic label, as Bartłomiej Gembicki has highlighted in this journal.⁴ Composition techniques are often described using strongly connoted terms, with no explanation as to why such specific definitions were chosen, thus confusing the reader. Discussing Schirack's output, for instance, Petőczová defines counterpoint as a 'Franco-Flemish technique', while polychorality is 'Venetian'; German settings are 'built on the *stile recitativo* of Heinrich Schütz', and word-music relations are '*musica poetica* style' (pp. 369–370).

⁴ Bartłomiej Gembicki, 'Zagadnienie polichoralności w polskich badaniach muzykologicznych' [The question of polychorality in Polish musicological research], *Muzyka* 61 (2016) no. 3, pp. 55–68.

Are these just descriptive labels, or do they imply that Schimrack was thinking in these terms? Was Schimrack conscious of the *venezianità* of polychorality, its *italianità*, or perhaps neither? I realise that it is often difficult to answer questions concerning the perception of composition techniques, but such definitions should be carefully evaluated and used with restraint, especially in a collection of essays devoted to the reception history of such techniques.

Notwithstanding the weaknesses I have highlighted, these conference proceedings constitute an important step forward for the musicological discourse on the ‘internationality’ of Italian music during the sixteenth

and seventeenth centuries. It becomes very clear that the diffusion of Italian music and ‘Italian style’ was fostered by parameters of different kinds, involving aesthetic, religious and political factors. Most importantly, the publication makes accessible to musicology a wealth of knowledge and studies that are often ignored, probably because of language barriers. Thus *Italian music in Central-Eastern Europe* represents a bright example of international and interlingual cultural exchange, which beautifully mirrors the historical phenomena discussed.

Antonio Chemotti

Instytut Sztuki, Polska Akademia Nauk