BEATA BOLESŁAWSKA, THE LIFE AND WORKS OF ANDRZEJ PANUFNIK (1914–1991),

translated by Richard J. Reisner, Farnham 2015 Ashgate, ISBN 978-1-4094-6329-0 (hb)

Andrzej Panufnik made no secret of his tumultuous personal history. *Composing myself*, his 1987 autobiography, detailed a life that had been upended by war, marital strife, political oppression, and emigration before culminating in marital harmony and professional achievement.[1] *Impulse and mesign in my music*, published in 1974, was just as forthcoming about the rationales that govern Panufnik's compositional language.[2] Especially in the English-speaking world, Panufnik has long been the primary author of his own story.

The wealth of material that Panufnik left behind poses challenges to the researcher. It is all too easy to be swayed by the composer's subjective, self-interested take on events. The drama that makes him a compelling biographical subject also lends itself to reductive interpretations driven by Cold War stereotypes and innuendo. It is therefore important for the researcher to tread carefully. Beata Bolesławska accomplishes this admirably in *The life and works of Andrzej Panufnik (1914–1991)*. Combining painstaking archival research with oral histories from those who knew the composer, Bolesławska presents a sober, nuanced account of a complex figure.

When Bolesławska's study was first published in Poland in 2001, the tenth anniversary of the composer's death, it filled an important gap in Panufnik scholarship.[3] Due to the circumstances of Panufnik's defection in 1954, decades elapsed before he could be a subject of research in Poland. The 1988 musicological conference 'Muzyka źle obecna' [Music badly present] was an important early step in Polish inquiries into Panufnik's life and work.[4] Studies by Tadeusz Kaczyński followed in the 1990s.[5] Bolesławska's 2001 monograph constituted a major advance in scholarship on the composer. Since the publication of her landmark volume, research has continued through the efforts of Jadwiga Paja-Stach, Adrian Thomas, David Tompkins, and Bolesławska herself.[6] She incorporates recent sources into the new edition of her monograph, published in 2015 by Ashgate press. Richard J. Reisner's very readable English-language translation is now making this important work of scholarship accessible to a larger audience.

The book falls into two large parts: a lengthy, chronological account of Panufnik's life (into which discussions of the works are intertwined) followed by a more concise exploration of his compositional method. An epigraph by Kaczyński sets the tone: 'Panufnik was to music what Gombrowicz was to literature, Miłosz to poetry or Kołakowski to philosophy. He was that forbidden fruit – that artificially cut off branch of our culture' (p. 1). In other words,

1 Andrzej Panufnik, *Composing myself*, London 1987.

2 Andrzej Panufnik, *Impulse and design in my music*, London 1974.

3 Beata Bolesławska, *Panufnik*, Kraków 2001.

4 *Muzyka źle obecna*, ed. Krystyna Tarnawska-Kaczorowska, 2 vols., Warszawa 1989.

5 See, for instance, Tadeusz Kaczyński, *Andrzej Panufnik i jego muzyka*, Warszawa 1994.

6 These sources include: *Andrzej Panufnik's music and its reception: Studies*, ed. Jadwiga Paja-Stach, Kraków 2003; Adrian Thomas, 'File 750: composers, politics, and the Festival of Polish Music (1951)', *Polish Music Journal* 5/1 (2002), http://pmc.usc.edu/PMJ/issue/5.1.02/thomasfile.html, 30th May, 2017; David G. Tompkins, *Composing the party line: Music and politics in early Cold War Poland and East Germany*, West Lafayette 2013.

emigration, and the complex negotiations of Polish identity it entailed, is the central problem of Panufnik's biography.

This eventual decision colors the narrative even before Panufnik makes it, as when Bolesławska unsettles her chronology to, for example, compare *Lullaby*'s positive reception by Polish critics in 1948 with the work's enforced disappearance from Poland's musical life after 1954. Bolesławska nevertheless demonstrates that Panufnik's departure from Poland was not a foregone conclusion. She documents two instances before 1954 in which Panufnik rejected the option of emigration. The first took place in 1939, when the budding composer and conductor was traveling throughout Western Europe and working on his first symphony. Felix Weingartner, one of Panufnik's teachers, experienced Nazi cultural policy firsthand when he lost his post in Vienna; he attempted to dissuade Panufnik from returning to Poland when he encountered his pupil in Great Britain. Panufnik refused because, Bolesławska indicates, he did not want to abandon his family when Europe was on the brink of war. The question of emigration arose once again in the immediate postwar years. On tour in Berlin in 1948, Panufnik turned a deaf ear to the Western colleagues who encouraged him to emigrate. This time, the rationale was loyalty to country: 'he believed, like other artists at that time, that he belonged in Poland', Bolesławska explains. Moreover, Panufnik believed that Poland 'would be able to preserve its independence, despite Soviet influence' (p. 91).

Panufnik, of course, turned out to be wrong: socialist realism was already taking root in Poland when he made this assessment. The Stalinist years that led to Panufnik's defection are the book's most sensitive material, and Bolesławska treads a careful path through this treacherous territory. She seeks to recuperate Panufnik from charges that, in works such as *Symphony of Peace* and *Song of the United Party*, he was little more than a cynical careerist who gained favors through collaborating with Poland's communist party, and who was therefore irredeemably tainted. She argues that the persistence of this view in Poland was, in fact, the result of Panufnik's emigration: unlike composers such as Tadeusz Baird and Kazimierz Serocki, whose earlier investments in socialist realism were reassessed in the post-Stalin thaw, views of Panufnik crystallized in 1954 and had remained hardened ever since. Bolesławska's intervention was thus long overdue in 2001, and it remains relevant today. Her strategy is not to deny Panufnik's politicized activities in the early 1950s. Instead, she rightly points out that 'almost no artists […] at that time were able to avoid, to a smaller or greater extent, concessions to the oppressive political system' (p. 108). Panufnik's activities, then, were hardly unusual. What was unusual was his leading position in Polish musical life, which subjected him to uniquely intense pressure: Witold Lutosławski, for instance, was able to maneuver in ways Panufnik could not because, at the time, he was the lesser-known composer. The picture that emerges in Bolesławska's account is of a party-state bureaucracy that was eager to leverage the prestige of one of Poland's brightest musical lights. And for all of Panufnik's expressed distaste for politicized public appearances, he did share some common ground with party-state functionaries: Bolesławska stresses that the themes of peace that aligned so well with official discourse were simultaneously manifestations of a genuine personal interest that would persist throughout Panufnik's subsequent career.

Her account of Panufnik's decision to emigrate is similarly nuanced. The timing of this choice – 1954 – appears surprising in retrospect. Stalin had died in 1953, and

a reassessment of socialist realism and its accompanying cultural policy, which would eventually lead to the establishment of the Warsaw Autumn International Festival of Contemporary Music and the thorough metamorphosis of many composers' musical language, was already quietly underway. Why leave Poland when the crisis was nearly at an end? Bolesławska judiciously considers Panufnik's motivations: dissatisfaction with the lack of immediate change after Stalin's death, dismay that the communist party sought to exploit his personal relationships to advance its aims, and, above all, a desire for freedom. The freedom Panufnik sought, Bolesławska points out, was not latitude to experiment with the techniques of Western Europe's postwar avant-garde, but liberation from the bureaucratic responsibilities that had impinged on his ability to compose. He also anticipated that his flight from Poland would benefit his colleagues by drawing worldwide attention to their plight – a point on which, Bolesławska admits, Panufnik was woefully naïve. The strength of her account of Panufnik's emigration is her correction of lingering misapprehensions (such as that Panufnik left behind several substantial monetary debts) and her simultaneous acknowledgment that he did real damage to his Polish colleagues, whose freedoms were restricted in the wake of his departure, and to his relatives, who lost opportunities to work and study. Through exploring the various reasons for and ramifications of Panufnik's emigration, Bolesławska performs a useful service within a specifically Polish context while also making points that contribute to broader conversations about musicians' relationships to power.

Was emigration the escape from politics for which Panufnik had hoped? Not quite. Even after settling in the United Kingdom, he could not disentangle himself from fraught power relationships. Here, the challenges tended to be aesthetic and professional rather than more narrowly political. British composers who had extended a warm welcome during Panufnik's earlier sojourns in their country turned chilly once Panufnik was there to stay – and hence a potential rival. While conducting the City of Birmingham Symphony Orchestra gave Panufnik much-needed stability and financial support from 1957 to 1959, his clashes with the ensemble's recalcitrant first violinist also gave him plenty of headaches. An even bigger problem was William Glock, the BBC's powerful Controller of Music from 1959 to 1973. Glock's avant--garde tastes left little room for composers like Panufnik, whose style and strategies were, according to the modernist mores of the day, too conservative to merit BBC promotion. Only with Glock's retirement did Panufnik's chances for BBC support improve. It was many years before Great Britain became a stable professional home.

Through it all, Panufnik strove to nurture his compositional voice. The tensions of emigration that figure so powerfully in his biography also profoundly shaped his creative work. At times, Panufnik cleaved to a Polish identity expressed through references to folklore and national symbolism. This was especially true in the 1980s, which saw the rise of Solidarity in Poland as well as the imposition of Martial Law from December 1981 to July 1983. Observing these events from afar, Panufnik composed pieces such as *Sinfonia Votiva*, a supplication to the Black Madonna of Częstochowa that incorporates material from the *Bogurodzica*, and the *Bassoon Concerto*, which depicts and protests against Father Jerzy Popiełuszko's murder by the Polish secret police. Unlike Lutosławski, who was famously cagey about extramusical signification in his compositions, Panufnik openly professed connections between these works and current events in the country he had not quite left behind. Yet Panufnik was not always keen to tie himself to Poland via

his music. Once he had found his footing in Great Britain, he consciously sought to strip national references from his style, focusing instead in the 1970s on world-embracing themes and abstract principles of geometry in pieces such as *Universal Prayer*, *Triangles*, and *Sinfonia di Sfere*. Panufnik, in short, was negotiating the opposing forces of nationalism and cosmopolitanism that have long animated Poland's musical life.[7] Bolesławska's account provides an opportunity to observe how this pervasive binary dynamic played out at the level of an individual compositional career.

Although he was physically distant from his homeland, Panufnik was still linked to compositional developments there in yet another way: like many of his colleagues, he grappled with the question of how to develop and maintain a personal, independent voice in the midst of a dizzying array of new musical trends. For Panufnik, years of systematic experimentation led to an approach that emphasized balance, architecturally precise construction, and a rapprochement between modernism and tradition. Bolesławska's theoretical discussion is aimed at a non-specialist audience; however, analysts will find much of interest here, too. She concisely summarizes the main traits of Panufnik's compositional language, lucidly details his geometric formal structures, and explains how he used a three-note cell to build pitch material in his later works.

Above all, Bolesławska describes Panufnik as a truly independent composer, one who achieved an ideal balance between emotion and logic in works that owed nothing to the passing fads of contemporary fashion. This argument is compelling; but in order to make her point, Bolesławska relies too often on an overly simplistic characterization of 'contemporary music' as inherently un-(or anti-) emotional. Her tight focus on Panufnik also has some drawbacks when it comes to perceiving the full magnitude of his achievement. Emotionality was a key idea in the reception of Poland's musical avant-garde in the 1950s and 1960s.[8] As Lisa Cooper Vest has forcefully demonstrated, many powerful composers and critics in 1960s Poland were invested in a notion of an avant-garde that was tied to tradition.[9] And Panufnik's interest in symmetry put him in good company amongst twentieth-century composers. What makes the emotional qualities and compositional strategies in his music distinct? Some further contextualization would have helped to make Panufnik's unique contributions more readily apparent.

Bolesławska more convincingly demonstrates that, for all of his independence, Panufnik could not have created his compositional voice alone. She traces his interest in geometry and symmetry back to the influence of his father, Tomasz Panufnik, whose memoirs and diaries provide rich archival material in the book's early chapters. Panufnik's emigration depended on a network of contacts in Western Europe. Once he was in Great Britain, he could not have succeeded without the connections he forged there. By far the most important of these was his relationship with Camilla Jessel, who married Panufnik in 1963. Camilla – energetic, adventurous, industrious, and a force in her own right – played a vital role in managing Panufnik's affairs, which he tended to neglect (to his professional and financial detriment). Her emotional support was just as crucial to

7 Zofia Helman, 'The Dilemma of twentieth-century Polish music: National style or universal values', in: *After Chopin: Essays on Polish music*, ed. Maja Trochimczyk, Los Angeles 2000, p. 205–242.

8 Lisa Jakelski, 'Górecki's *Scontri* and avant-garde music in Cold War Poland', *The Journal of Musicology* 26 (2009) no. 2, p. 205–239.

9 Lisa Cooper Vest, *The Discursive foundations of the Polish musical avant-garde at midcentury: Aesthetics of progress, meaning, and national identity*, Indiana University 2014 (unpublished Ph.D. diss.).

Panufnik's development during the last decades of his career. The self-sacrificing, ever-encouraging wife is a common figure in male artists' biographies; these women's stories, however, are not always told. It is to Bolesławska's credit that she devotes such sustained, careful attention to documenting the effort and investment on Camilla's part that enabled Panufnik to thrive.

Like Panufnik, Bolesławska's study of the composer's life and works has links to multiple worlds, and it makes valuable contributions in each of them. This well-paced, logically organized book makes a worthwhile intervention in the scholarship on Panufnik, and, in its new translation, it will be a vital resource for English-language readers. A signal achievement when it was first published, Bolesławska's *The life and works of Andrzej Panufnik* continues to set the standard for research.

Lisa Jakelski
Eastman School of Music

ZABYTKI MUZYCZNE W ZBIORACH MUZEUM UNIWERSYTETU JAGIELLOŃSKIEGO. KATALOG, KONTEKSTY, ALBUM, RED. RENATA SUCHOWIEJKO

Kraków 2016 Wydawnictwo Fall ss. 501 (w tym 152 s. il.), ISBN 978-83-65110-39-8

Przygotowana pod redakcją Renaty Suchowiejko publikacja *Zabytki muzyczne w zbiorach Muzeum Uniwersytetu Jagiellońskiego. Katalog, konteksty, album* to pierwsze całościowe i gruntowne opracowanie tej części kolekcji Muzeum Uniwersytetu Jagiellońskiego w Krakowie, która dotyczy kultury muzycznej. Jest to praca zespołowa, bo znawcy wybranych działów kultury muzycznej dobrze się wzajemnie uzupełniają. Oryginalne osiągnięcie stanowi pełna kontrola procesu badawczego: od ewidencji (a często i odkrywania obiektów w magazynach muzealnych), przez „rozumowany" katalog z wprowadzeniami i komentarzami, aż do interpretacji kulturowej i ujęć syntetycznych. Omawiana książka, wykraczając ponad zadania katalogu, wyróżnia się w palecie publikacji pomnikowo-źródłowych. Jest próbą przybliżenia epoki, w której powstawała – dość spontanicznie i okolicznościowo – kolekcja muzealna Uniwersytetu Jagiellońskiego (głównie XIX w. i przełom XIX/XX w.). Trafne jest – pochodzące od Wilhelma Diltheya – motto książki, iż „z historią mamy do czynienia wszędzie tam, gdzie dochodzi do zrozumienia życia, które stało się przeszłością".

Praca, po ogólnym wprowadzeniu redaktorki tomu („Śladami muzycznej przeszłości", s. 9–14), składa się z trzech części: I „Katalog zabytków muzycznych" (s. 15–202), II „Źródła – analizy – konteksty" (s. 203–311), III „Zabytki muzyczne – album fotografii" (s. 313–466). Katalog jest troiście zadysponowany zgodnie z zawartością muzeum, na którą składają się instrumenty muzyczne, nośniki z zaprogramowanym repertuarem dla automatofonów, spuścizna kompozytorów polskich.

Beniamin Vogel, autor opracowania części „Instrumenty muzyczne i akcesoria" (s. 15–82), kolekcję, na którą składają się instrumenty strunowe klawiszowe – fortepiany (poz. 1–9), instrumenty strunowe szarpane i smyczkowe – cytry, gitara, skrzypce (poz. 10–19), instrumenty dęte – flet poprzeczny (poz. 20), instrumenty dęte ze stroikami przelotowymi – fisharmonika (poz. 21), instrumenty mechaniczne (poz. 22–35), akcesoria muzyczne – pulpity, batuty i inne (poz. 36–44), gramofony (poz.